

1a/11.00/aka/ks

The House met at eleven of the clock,
MR. CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MEMBER SWORN

Shri Pravinchandra Raghunathji Naik (Gujarat)

OBITUARY REFERENCES

MR. CHAIRMAN: Hon. Members, I refer with profound sorrow to the passing away of Shri M.S. Abdul Khader and Shri Nana Deshmukh, former Members of this House.

Shri M. S. Abdul Khader passed away on the 3rd of October, 2009 at the age of 78 years.

Born at Chennai in May, 1931, Shri Khader had his education at Presidency College, Chennai.

A businessman by vocation, Shri Khader was associated with several social welfare organizations. He was a Member of the Advisory Committee of Tamil Nadu Government for Backward Classes, Tamil Nadu Wakf Board and Madras Corporation from 1959 to 1964. He was also the Mayor of Madras from 1959 to 1960.

Shri M. S. Abdul Khader represented the State of Tamil Nadu in this House from April 1972 to April, 1978.

In the passing away of Shri M. S. Abdul Khader, the country has lost an able parliamentarian.

Shri Nana Deshmukh passed away on the 27th of February, 2010 at the age of 93 years.

Born in Kadoli in Parbhani District of Maharashtra in October, 1916, Shri Deshmukh had his education at Government High School, Washim in Akola District and Inter Commerce from Birla College, Pilani.

An agriculturist by vocation, Shri Deshmukh was a renowned social worker, who worked for the realization of the dream of total transformation through total

development with people's initiative and participation in a number of villages of Uttar Pradesh, Bihar, Maharashtra and Madhya Pradesh.

Shri Deshmukh founded the Saraswati Shishu Mandir, a chain of pre-primary and primary schools spread across India in 1950. He had set up the Deen Dayal Research Institute in 1969 with the primary objective of finding innovative, eco-friendly and sustainable models of development. He also established the Chitrakoot Gramodaya Vishwavidyalaya in Madhya Pradesh, India's first Rural University in 1991, and was its first Chancellor.

Shri Nana Deshmukh was honoured with many awards including the Padma Vibhushan in 1999, National Citizen Award in 2001, Jeevan Gaurav Puraskar in 2003 and the Doctor of Letters by several universities for social service.

Shri Nana Deshmukh was a Nominated Member of this House from November, 1999 to November, 2005. He was also a Member of the Sixth Lok Sabha.

In the passing away of Shri Nana Deshmukh, the country has lost an eminent social activist and an able parliamentarian.

We deeply mourn the passing away of Shri M. S. Abdul Khader and Shri Nana Deshmukh.

I request the Members to rise in their places and observe silence as a mark of respect to the memory of the departed.

(Hon. Members then stood in silence for one minute.)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Secretary-General will convey to the members of the bereaved families our deep sense of sorrow and sympathy.

(Ends)

(Followed by 1b/tdb)

TDB-NB/1B/11.05

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 81. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, I have given a notice for suspension of the Question Hour.

...(Interruptions)... Sir, the Union Government is not worried about the *aam aadmi*.

...(Interruptions)...

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि : सभापति जी, पेट्रोल और डीज़ल के दाम ... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Question No. 81. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, the Union Government is not serious about the *aam*

aadmi. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, I have given a notice for suspension of the Question

Hour. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, the Government is not serious about the *aam aadmi*.

The increase in the prices of petrol and diesel will grievously hurt the *aam aadmi*.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, please. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we want that the Question Hour should be suspended.

...(Interruptions)... The hike in the prices of petrol and diesel should be rolled back.

...(Interruptions)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : सभापति जी, यह बहुत ही अलोकतांत्रिक कदम है । महंगाई पर चर्चा के बाद इस तरह से पेट्रोल और डीज़ल की कीमतें बढ़ाई गई हैं (व्यवधान)

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, petrol and diesel price-hike is the most important question.

...(Interruptions)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : प्रधान मंत्री जी को इस पर सदन में आकर बयान देना चाहिए ... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please allow the Question Hour to proceed. ...(Interruptions)...

Hon. Members, please allow the Question Hour to proceed. ...(Interruptions)...

Please allow the Question Hour to proceed. ...(Interruptions)... Your supplementary, please.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : सभापति जी, सारे हिंदुस्तान की गरीब जनता चाहती है कि डीज़ल के दाम कम किए जाएं । गरीब की कमर टूट रही है, कोई सुनने वाला नहीं है ... (व्यवधान) इनको जवाब देना चाहिए ... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your supplementary, please. ...(Interruptions)... Please allow the Question Hour to proceed. ...(Interruptions)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, petrol and diesel price hike is the most important question.

...(Interruptions)... We want that this price-hike should be rolled back.

...(Interruptions)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : यह अत्याचार गरीब जनता कब तक बरदाश्त करेगी ... (व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 12 o'clock.

The House then adjourned at six minutes past
eleven of the clock.

kgg/vnk/12.00/1c

The House re-assembled at twelve of the clock,
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Papers to be laid on the Table.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN: Sir, I lay on the Table, under Section 33 of the National Rural Employment Guarantee Act, 2005, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification No. 149/09/F.No.6-43/GC/NREGA/2009(II)-PR, dated the 28th October, 2009, publishing the Andaman and Nicobar Islands (Rural Employment Grievance Redressal Mechanism) Rules, 2009, along with delay statement.

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, I lay on the Table-

I.(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (1) of Section 619A of the Companies Act, 1956:-

(a) Thirty-second Annual Report and Accounts of the India Trade Promotion Organisation (ITPO), New Delhi, for the year 2008-09, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India thereon.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Centre.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

II.(1) A copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers, under sub-section (2) and (3) of Section 22 of the Tobacco Board Act, 1975:-

(a) Annual Report and Accounts of the Tobacco Board, Guntur, for the year 2008-09, together with the Auditor's Report on the Accounts.

(b) Review by Government on the working of the above Board.

(2) Statement (in English and Hindi) giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

SHRI AJAY MAKEN: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Home Affairs, under sub-section (3) of Section 154 the Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force Act, 1992:-

(1) G.S.R. 34 (E), dated the 15th January, 2010, publishing the Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force, Para Medical Cadre, Inspector (Pharmacist) Recruitment Rules, 2010.

(2) G.S.R. 913 (E), dated the 21st December, 2009, publishing the Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force, General Duty Cadre, Group 'A' Posts Recruitment (Amendment) Rules, 2009.

SHRI R.P.N.SINGH: Sir, I to lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Notifications of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways, under Section 10 of the National Highways Act, 1956

(1) S.O. 2882 (E), dated the 12th November, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 17.756 to K.M. 42.525 (Agra-Bharatpur Section) on National Highway No. 11 in Agra District in the State of Uttar Pradesh

(2) S.O. 2898 (E), dated the 16th November, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 358.000 to K.M. 366.000 (Bareilly-Sitapur Section) on National Highway No. 24 in Hardoi District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.

(3) S.O. 2899 (E), dated the 16th November, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 262.000 to K.M. 288.000 (Bareilly-Sitapur Section) on National Highway No. 24 in Bareilly District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.

(4) S.O. 2900 (E), dated the 16th November, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 343.400 to K.M. 358.000 and K.M. 366.000 to K.M. 377.200 (Bareilly-Sitapur Section) on National Highway No. 24 in Kheri District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.

(5) S.O. 2901 (E), dated the 16th November, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 288.000 to K.M. 343.400 (Bareilly-Sitapur

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 03.03.2010

Section) on National Highway No. 24 in Shahjahanpur District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.

- (6) S.O. 2902 (E), dated the 16th November, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 377.200 to K.M. 413.200 (Bareilly-Sitapur Section) on National Highway No. 24 in Sitapur District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.
- (7) S.O. 3120 (E), dated the 5th December, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 93.800 to K.M. 176.760 (Delhi - Agra Section) on National Highway No. 2 in Mathura District in the State of Uttar Pradesh.
- (8) S.O. 3254 (E), dated the 21st December, 2009, regarding acquisition of land, with or without structure, from K.M. 16.100 to K.M. 18.800 (Delhi - Agra Section) on National Highway No. 2 in South Delhi District in the State of Delhi.

(Ends)

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON TRANSPORT, TOURISM AND CULTURE

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I present the following Reports (in English and Hindi) of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture:-

- (i) * One Hundred and Fifty-first Report on the "Merger of Indian Airlines and Air India: Its impact on the Civil Aviation Sector";
- (ii) One Hundred and Fifty-second Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Fortieth Report on the "Promotion of Tourism in Jammu and Kashmir; and
- (iii) One Hundred and Fifty-third Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations/observations of the Committee contained in its One Hundred and Forty-ninth Report on the "Development of Tourism Infrastructure and Amenities for the Commonwealth Games 2010".

REPORTS OF THE DEPARTMENT RELATED PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE ON AGRICULTURE

* The report at Sl No. (i) was presented to Hon'ble Chairman, Rajya Sabha on 21st January, 2010.

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI: Sir, I lay on the Table, a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following Reports of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Agriculture:-

- (i) Fourth Report on "Demands for Grants (2009-10)" of the Ministry of Agriculture (Department of Agricultural Research and Education); and
- (ii) Fifth Report on "Demands for Grants (2009-10)" of the Ministry of Food Processing Industries.

**MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE AGRICULTURAL AND PROCESSED FOOD
PRODUCTS EXPORT DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (APEDA)**

SHRI JYOTIRADITYA MADHAVRAO SCINDIA: Sir, I move the following Motion:-

"That in pursuance of clause (d) of sub-section (4) of Section 4 of the Agricultural and Processed Food Products Export Development Authority Act, 1985 (No.2 of 1986), read with Rule 3 of the Agricultural and Processed Food Products Export Development Authority Rules, 1986, this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Chairman may direct, one Member from among the Members of the House, to be a member of the Agricultural and Processed Food Products Export Development Authority."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, we shall take up reply, to the discussion on the price rise, by the Minister.

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि : सर, लोक सभा में सरकार अल्पमत में आ गई है....(व्यवधान)....सरकार के पास बहुमत नहीं है(व्यवधान)....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We will take it up later. We will take up the reply to Short Duration Discussion on price rise. (Interruptions)

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Sir, we want an answer regarding the rise in prices of petrol and diesel. Is he going to answer on that? (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Maitreyan, we will take it up later; I think, there is some agreement. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, the concern of price rise was discussed in the House, and on that day, the Finance Minister, while intervening and responding on this subject....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is over.

DR. V. MAITREYAN; Sir, I am not a party to the agreement. (Interruptions) I want an answer. I would like to know whether the Minister is going to reply regarding the spiraling price hike. Also, is he going to reply regarding the general price rise? Or, what is he going to reply? Because, whatever he wants to say is already replied in the Budget! What new thing is he going to say today? (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Maitreyan, please listen. This House has had a Short Duration Discussion on price rise. After that, it was decided that the hon. Minister for Food and Agriculture would reply the next day. Now, he would be replying and you should cooperate.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: The Minister of Finance while intervening in the discussion said that he could not make certain remarks since he had to place the Budget. But, the day he placed the Budget, he increased the prices of diesel and petrol.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have an ample opportunity to discuss that during the Budget discussion.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Then, Sir, the Prime Minister sitting in Saudi Arabia has said that there is no question of a roll-back. When the Parliament is in Session....

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Ahluwalia, you have an ample opportunity to speak when we take up discussion on the Budget.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: When the people are agitated and on the streets, the Parliament is in turmoil. Bypassing the Parliament....

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: He is the democratic head of the Government and how can he say that there can be no roll-back? (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You see, every Member and the Government have their own responsibilities. (Interruptions) When we discuss the Budget, you can raise these things. Who is preventing you from raising it? You can raise it. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, can the Finance Minister come and reply?
(Interruptions)

(Followed by kls/1d)

KLS/MP/1D/12.05

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : यह अलोकतांत्रिक काम है, जन-विरोधी काम है। इन्होंने डीज़ल के दाम बढ़ाकर .. (व्यवधान) ..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I appeal to the Members that because an important subject has been discussed in the House, price rise has been debated, let the Minister reply to the debate. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: The Agriculture and Consumer Affairs Minister is here. Is he going to reply on the issue of petrol and diesel price hike? ...(Interruptions).. That is the point. Sir, while he is responding, can you call the Finance Minister? ...(Interruptions).. The Finance Minister should come. (Interruptions)

श्री विक्रम वर्मा : सर, जवाब कृषि मंत्री से कराया जा रहा है और महंगाई के लिए डीज़ल और पेट्रोल का दाम बढ़ाया जा रहा है। ...(व्यवधान)... एक-दूसरे पर responsibility थोपी जा रही है।

DR. V.MAITREYAN: Let the Finance Minister come. ...(Interruptions).. Let the Prime Minister come and reply to his allies in the House. ...(Interruptions)..

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि : महोदय ...(व्यवधान) ..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You speak one by one. (Interruptions) How can I listen?

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, we are willing to hear the reply of Shri Sharad Pawar. (Interruptions).. Will he respond to the hike in the prices of diesel and petrol during his reply? ...(Interruptions) ..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is not replying on the Budget. ...(Interruptions).. He is not replying on the Budget. (Interruptions) Let us finish the Short Notice Question. (Interruptions) ..

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: You fix up another date for that. (Interruptions)

DR. V.MAITREYAN: Let the Finance Minister come here and say that there will be no rollback. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. N.K. Singh, your Short Notice Question is listed but the Members are not allowing you to raise this question. (Interruptions).. I will call you, but the Members are not allowing to raise this question.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Members of Parliament have demanded discussion on the price hike. (Interruptions).. We want discussion on that. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, I am on another point. Since the price rise which the Government itself has admitted in its report and the hike in petrol and diesel prices has a cascading effect on food items, (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can seek clarification. (Interruptions) I cannot allow it. (Interruptions) The Agriculture Minister will not be able to reply on the Budget Proposals.

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : सर, क्या शरद पवार जी पेट्रोल और डीज़ल प्राइस पर रोल बैक करेंगे? ...(व्यवधान)... सर, महंगाई पर चर्चा हुई, महंगाई बढ़ाने का प्रस्ताव आया और उस प्रस्ताव को वापस लेने की हम मांग कर रहे हैं। क्या शरद पवार जी उस मांग को स्वीकार करते हुए डीज़ल और पेट्रोल प्राइस पर ... वे हाथ हिलाकर नहीं का इशारा कर रहे हैं !
...(व्यवधान)... वे क्या इशारा कर रहे हैं?(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : उनको पहले सुनिए तो सही। ..(व्यवधान).. Let us listen to him.
(Interruptions)

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : गवर्नमेंट क्या कर रही है? ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री विक्रम वर्मा : इस सेशन का उपयोग क्या है, ज़रा यह बताइए। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, it will have a cascading effect on food prices.
(Interruptions) I

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When we take up the Budget you can raise the point whether it has cascading effect or not. (Interruptions) When the Budget is discussed the Members have ample opportunities to raise their points. Not even a single item has been taken up and discussed in the House. Show me the precedent. Never in history such a thing has happened. (Interruptions)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, I am raising another point. ..(Interruptions)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : ऐसा अलोकतांत्रिक, जन-विरोधी बजट कभी नहीं आया। ऐसा अजनतांत्रिक बजट आज तक नहीं आया। हो सकता है कि हम लोगों ने पहली बार बजट का बहिष्कार किया हो। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति : मैं आपकी बात का जवाब नहीं दे सकता, Budget is budget.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : ऐसा जन-विरोधी बजट कभी नहीं आया। हिंदुस्तान की गरीब जनता की कमर तोड़ दी गई और ऊपर से तेल के दाम बढ़ा दिए गए। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, the Prime Minister is saying that there will not be any rollback. (Interruptions)... He said it in a foreign land when the Parliament Session is in progress. (Interruptions) Does it constitute the breach of privilege of the House?

MR, DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is only after the presentation of the Budget. (Interruptions)...

(Followed by 1E/SSS)

SSS-SC/1E/12.10

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, we are discussing rolling back of fuel price hike.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are discussing.

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: So, how can the Prime Minister say there will not be any roll back of fuel price hike when the Parliament is in session? (Interruptions)

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : सर, गरीब जनता को संरक्षण दीजिए। ...(व्यवधान)...

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Let him come and say, 'there will be no roll back on the fuel price hike.' (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can raise that point also in the discussion. We will examine your point also. When you are not debating, then, what can I do? (Interruptions) I can't understand why you are preventing a discussion on the price rise. (Interruptions)

DR. V. MAITREYAN: No, no, Sir, I want an answer to the question that I raised.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We have discussed price rise thoroughly and it was announced on that day that price rise will be taken up on Monday. Monday was a

holiday. Tuesday was also a holiday. Now, we have listed it. Why are you preventing the Minister? (Interruptions)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Why can't the Minister answer...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, it has nothing to do with price rise. (Interruptions) He will not be able to answer on the hike in petrol prices. (Interruptions) Mr. Sharad Pawarji will not be able to answer that.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: If you permit me to speak, Sir, there is one suggestion. Nobody is against the discussion. We want to have a reply. We are ready to...

SHRI PRAVEEN RASHTRAPAL: You cannot dictate.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Nobody is dictating. (Interruptions)

श्री उपसभापति : वेंकैया जी, आप मुझसे बात कीजिए। ..(व्यवधान).. You address me. Please Mr. Rashtrapal, please help me to conduct the House.

श्री एम.वेंकैया नायडु : राष्ट्रपाल जी, आप अपने क्षेत्र में जाइए। वहां आपको जनता बताएगी। ..(व्यवधान).. Sir, my point is, you have raised a very relevant point. When the Budget is presented the entire Opposition got agitated and made an unprecedented walk out. Why are you saying, 'why are you not ready to hear the reply?' Yes, we are ready to hear the reply but, what is there to hear? The simple question is, the Leader of the House who happens to be the Prime Minister has chosen a foreign land to make a categorical statement and saying, 'no roll back'. Then, what is there to discuss?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Where is that foreign land?

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: This is what everybody is asking. (Interruptions) Yes, he said it in a foreign country. He said it in Saudi Arabia. So, we are agitated...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Venkaiah Naidu, you raise all those issues while debating on the Budget. (Interruptions)

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, nobody is opposed to listening to his reply. We are ready to listen to his reply. He is the Minister of the Government. He represents the Government. Let him speak on the issue of petrol, diesel price hike.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no, there are precedents. Other Ministers have never replied whether...

SHRI D. RAJA: Outside the Parliament everybody makes a statement on roll back. Now, inside the Parliament let him say, 'no roll back.'

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chair cannot direct that you reply.

SHRI D. RAJA: As Members we are asking.

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): The entire issue is connected to the debate which was going on in the House. The whole day we debated price rise and the failure of the Government to contain prices. That debate was adjourned for the Minister's reply today. We would like to hear the Minister today. But, in between came the Union Budget. In the Union Budget, there has been protests in Parliament, outside Parliament on fuel hike. Now, certainly we expected the Government to make a statement with regard to the demand of the opposition and some of its own allies on rolling back the fuel price hike. Now, when the Parliament is in Session and that demand is also linked to what we were discussing in the House, instead of answering in the House, you choose, if not exactly a foreign land, mid air, to reject the demand of the whole country. Now, certainly the Prime Minister should have been more serious about it. Let him come to the House and let him give us the reasons why he is refusing the demand for the (Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That can be raised only when there is a discussion on the debate. (Interruptions)

श्री रुद्रनारायण पाणि : *

* Not recorded.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nothing will go on record. (Interruptions). I again appeal to the hon. Members, allow the hon. Minister to reply to the debate and then, later on you can raise these issues. (Interruptions)

(Followed by USY/1F)

-SSS-USY/1F/12.15

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: by calling Yechuryji, and he allowed me. Further to that point, Sir, the Prime Minister, through his statement, has created a lot of confusion.....(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can raise all that during the debate whether the Prime Minister is right or wrong. (Interruptions) There is no notice before the House. (Interruptions) There are rules and procedures. Let us follow the rules and procedures. (Interruptions) Where is it that the Prime Minister has broken....(Interruptions)

SHRI SITARAM YECHURY: Sir, you please answer my question. Does it constitute a breach of privilege? (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How can I straightway answer your question, without a notice, whether it is a breach of privilege? (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: The Prime Minister has said that there would be 0.04 per cent impact on the Wholesale Price Index. This is adding salt to the wounds. And, it is contradicting the hon. Minister's own agenda that says that the fuel price hike has a cascading impact. So, what the Prime Minister is saying, what the Agriculture Minister is saying, what the other Government people are saying, they are all contradicting each other. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You start a debate and raise it before the House. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, our question is....(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What you are objecting about the levy and the rise in the prices of petroleum products, you raise it during the....(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, let me finish my point. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This has nothing to do with the price rise. (Interruptions) What can I do? (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, let me finish my point. (Interruptions) Sir, can I finish my point? (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Under the rules there is no breach. (Interruptions) There is a provision. You can discuss it and raise those issues. Rules are there. (Interruptions) There is a rule. When a particular subject is already listed, and is going to be taken up, it cannot be....(Interruptions) Rules are there in this regard. (Interruptions) You question it during the debate. (Interruptions) You question it during the debate. (Interruptions)

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: The Leader of the House is not here. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: During the Budget, when he comes....(Interruptions) Please, I appeal....(Interruptions) People are watching us. (Interruptions) People are watching to hear the reply of the Agriculture Minister on price rise. (Interruptions) No; no. (Interruptions) Do you want reply or not? (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Let the Prime Minister come or the Finance Minister come and, then,.... (Interruptions) When he will be there at 2 o' clock, we will take it up. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is for the Government to answer. I cannot.....(Interruptions) You lay the reply. (Interruptions) Now, I will call the Short Notice Discussion. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No; no, Sir. (Interruptions) No, Sir. (Interruptions)

DR. V. MAITREYAN: Let the Prime Minister come and say that there will be no roll back.... (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You are repeating the same thing. (Interruptions) This is a short notice question. (Interruptions)

Uncorrected/Not for publication - 03.03.2010

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, nothing has been done since morning. We wanted to do this. You can slate this Short Notice Discussion on some other day. There is no problem. (Interruptions) You can slate it on some other day. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I agree. (Interruptions) I can call you. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, you are not listening to the bigger problem. (Interruptions) You are going to the smaller problem. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am listening to you. (Interruptions) But, I am taking up the agenda. (Interruptions) What can I do? (Interruptions) Neither you allow me to take up this question, nor the hon. Minister's reply. (Interruptions)

(Contd. by 1g -- PK)

-USY/PK/1G/12.20

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): What is that I can do? ..(Interruptions).. It is a simple thing. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, the point is that Prime Minister is the Leader of the House. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, no. I cannot say that. It is for the Government to ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: He was aware that the reply has not come. ..(Interruptions)..

SHORT NOTICE QUESTION

TO BE ANSWERED ON THE 3RD MARCH, 2010/PHALGUNA 12, 1931 (SAKA)

MAOIST RAID AT EFR CAMP AT SILADA

SNQ. SHRI N.K. SINGH:

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS to be pleased to state:

- (a) whether armed Maoists raided the Eastern Frontier Rifles (EFR) camp at Silda near Midnapore town, Kolkata on 15th February, 2010 and killed a large number jawans;

- (b) if so, the facts thereof and whether the intelligence failure led to the attack on the police camp;
- (c) if so, whether the Union Government has conducted any preliminary probe into the attack by Maoists on police camp; and
- (d) if so, the further drastic steps Union Government proposes to take in consultation with State Governments to wipe out Naxalites in the Country?

ANSWER

MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM:

A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

अल्प सूचना प्रश्न

दिनांक 03.03.2010/12 फाल्गुन, 1931 (शक) को उत्तर के लिए

सिल्दा स्थित ई एफ आर कैम्प पर माओवादियों का छापा

श्री एन० के० सिंह:

क्या गृह मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या सशस्त्र माओवादियों ने दिनांक 15 फरवरी, 2010 को कोलकाता के मिदनापुर कस्बे के समीप सिल्दा स्थिति ईस्टर्न फ्रन्टियर राईफल्स (ई० एफ० आर०) पर छापा मारा था और उसमें अनेक जवान मारे गये थे। ;

(ख) यदि हां, तो उसके तथ्य क्या हैं और क्या पुलिस पर हमला आसूचना की विफलता का परिणाम था;

(ग) यदि हां, तो क्या संघ सरकार ने माओवादियों द्वारा पुलिस कैम्प पर किये गये आक्रमण की कोई प्राथमिक जांच करायी है; और

(घ) यदि हां, तो संघ सरकार राज्य सरकार के साथ परामर्श करके देश में नक्सलियों का सफाया करने के लिए कोई बड़े कदम उठाने जा रही है?

उत्तर

गृह मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री अजय माकन)

(क) से (घ) : एक विवरण सदन के पटल पर रखा जा रहा है।

STATEMENT REFERRED TO IN REPLY TO PART (a) TO (d) OF RAJYA SABHA SHORT NOTICE QUESTION "MAOISTS" RAID AT EASTERN FRONTIER RIFLES (EFR) CAMP AT "SILDA" IN WEST MIDNAPORE DISTRICT OF WEST BENGAL FOR REPLY ON 3.3.2010.

(a) & (b) : In West Bengal, armed cadres of CPI (Maoist) attacked the Eastern Frontier Rifles (EFR) camp at Silda under PS Binpur in district West Midnapore on February 15, 2010 at 1645 hrs. 24 EFR personnel and one civilian were killed while four EFR personnel and one civilian were injured in the incident, Prima facie, it appears that the security arrangements at the camp were inadequate.

The State Government has appointed a committee headed by the Home Secretary, West Bengal, to probe various aspects concerning the incident.

(c): No, Sir.

(d): Does not arise.

पश्चिम बंगाल के मिदनापुर जिले में सिल्दा स्थित ईस्टर्न फ्रंटियर राईफल (ई एफ आर) कैंप पर "माओवादियों का छापा" से संबंधित राज्य सभा में उत्तर के लिए नियत अल्प सूचना प्रश्न के उत्तर के भाग (क) से (घ) में उल्लिखित विवरण।

(क) और (ख) : पश्चिम बंगाल में सी पी आई (माओवादियों) कैडरों ने पश्चिमी मिदनापुर जिला में बिनपुर पुलिस स्टेशन में अन्तर्गत सिल्दा स्थित ईस्टर्न फ्रंटियर राईफल्स (ई एफ आर) कैंप पर दिनांक 15 फरवरी, 2010 को 1645 बजे आक्रमण कर दिया। इस घटना में 24 ई एफ आर कार्मिक और एक सिविलियन मारा गया जबकि 4 ई एफ आर कार्मिक और एक सिविलियन घायल हो गया। प्रथम दृष्टया यह प्रतीत होता है कि कैंप में सुरक्षा इंतजाम अपर्याप्त थे।

इस घटना से संबंधित विभिन्न पहलुओं की जांच किए जाने के लिए गृह सचिव, पश्चिम बंगाल की अध्यक्षता में राज्य सरकार ने एक समिति नियुक्ति की है।

(ग) : जी नहीं।

(घ): प्रश्न पैदा नहीं होता।

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot say that. ..(Interruptions).. Now, the point is, I will ask the hon. Minister of Agriculture to lay his reply if you are not interested in this. ..(Interruptions).. Because the reply has to go. ..(Interruptions).. What is that I

can do? Please tell me what can I do. (Interruptions).. Please tell me what can I do.

..(Interruptions)..

DR. V. MAITREYAN: No, Sir. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 2.00 p.m.

.. .. .

The House then adjourned at twenty-one minutes
past twelve of the clock.

PB/1h/2.00

The House reassembled at two of the clock,
THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) in the Chair.

SHORT DURATION DISCUSSION ON SITUATION ARISING OUT OF CONTINUED
RISE IN PRICES OF ESSENTIAL COMMODITIES IN THE COUNTRY -- (contd.)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Now, the hon. Minister will reply to the Short Duration
Discussion on Price Rise.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE & MINISTER OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS,
FOOD AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI SHARAD PAWAR):

Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, as the House is aware(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please.(Interruptions)... Let him reply.(Interruptions)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, before he begins his reply, I would like to say
just one thing.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sure, sure.

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD (BIHAR): Sir, the day-before-yesterday, the hon.
Minister made a reply in the Lok Sabha. Thereafter, two supervening factors have
taken place, the Budget speech by Pranab Babu and the PM justifying the imposition
of rise in diesel and petrol prices. This will impact cascading effect on the price

which he is going to reply. Would the hon. Agriculture Minister also respond to that?

This is my very respectful question which I would like to ask.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, this is not the subject with which I am dealing. That is why don't expect any reply on this particular subject which you have raised here from my side. But, certainly, I will try to reply to some of the most important points which have been raised by many hon. Members during the discussion which had taken place that day in the House on the price rise.

Sir, the Members are aware that the same discussion was there on the same day in both the Houses. So, it was not possible for me to attend the full debate in both the Houses. I did try to spend some time in both the Houses, sat here also, heard some of the hon. Members' speeches, but, ultimately, I have collected the detailed debate, the proceedings of the discussion of the House on 25th February and tried to understand the exact points which have been raised by many hon. Members.

Sir, the Members of this august House have expressed concern over the escalation of the food prices which we have witnessed for the last few months and the Government is fully seized of the seriousness of this issue that impact the livelihood of the masses. I would, therefore, like to assure the House that whatever steps are required to be taken have been taken and will be taken by the Government on this issue.

Under the federal system, this is definitely the responsibility of the Government of India but the hon. Members will agree with me that there is need of a coordinated effort by all stakeholders and the State Government is also an important stakeholder. We are trying our level best to keep an excellent rapport with the State Governments. On certain occasions, we also give them advices to handle these important issues. There was a discussion once in the same House and one of the hon. Members made a suggestion that we should also call the Chief Ministers' meeting. I think, on 6th of February, under the chairmanship of the hon. Prime Minister, a meeting of all the Chief Ministers was called in Delhi and we discussed

all these important issues there. We decided to set up a core group of the State Chief Ministers and some of the Central Ministers to deal these important subjects.

(Contd. by 1j/SKC)

1j/2.05/skc-lp

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (Contd.): The rising trend seen in prices over the last few months, as I have said earlier, is a matter of serious concern. I am sure that the hon. Members of this House will agree with me when I say that the prices of some essential commodities -- I am not saying all, but some essential commodities -- have shown a decline in the recent few months. Over the last three months, the prices of *atta*, *gram dal*, *tur dal*, *urad dal*, *moong dal*, *masoor dal*, potato and onion have shown a declining trend while the prices of rice, wheat and salt have remained constant. Apart from this, over the last one month, prices of wheat, sugar, mustard oil and tea have also started showing a declining trend. In fact, just a few days back, a delegation led by hon. Members of the Lok Sabha from West Bengal, Shri Basudeb Acharia and Shri Shyamal Chakraborty, who is an hon. Member of this House, met me along with some ex-MPs and requested that Government of India must take some initiatives to support potato farmers because the prices of potato in West Bengal have dropped down somewhere from eight to two rupees a kilo. I received a similar request from some hon. Members from Uttar Pradesh also.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: That is because there is no cold storage facility available for potato. Also, enough power supply is not available. Potato is a perishable good and you cannot store it; that is the problem. (Interruptions) Potato is a perishable crop and there is no cold storage facility. That is the reason.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: That is true, but. (Interruptions)

श्री राजनीति प्रसाद : वह रुपया व्यापारियों को खरीदने के लिए है..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: This means that the farmers are not being protected. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I hope, at least, the Hon. Members would agree that the prices of potato have substantially dropped, which ...(Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No, that is not the reason. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: That is the factual position. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We should not take that excuse to say that the prices of potato are falling. The prices are falling due to lack of storage facilities. There is no cold storage facility available.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please, allow him to reply. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: There might have been more production but there was no storage facility available.

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: They doubled the prices... (Interruptions)

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, may I raise a point? (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No. Let the hon. Minister reply; you may ask questions later. (Interruptions)

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, this problem is there in Karnataka and some parts of Andhra Pradesh also. The problem is that of cold storage. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: On the *National Bandh* day, the price of tomato was five rupees...(Interruptions). That does not mean that the prices are falling. It was because there were no facilities available for transportation of vegetables. That was the reason. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please, let him reply. (Interruptions)

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Sir, these are perishable items. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please, allow him to reply. Take your seats. You may seek clarifications after his reply, if you so wish. (Interruptions) Let him reply. Please, do not interrupt. Let him reply. You may seek clarifications later.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: For the sake of hon. Member, Shri Ahluwalia's information...(Interruptions)...आप क्या कह रहे हैं कि आलू का दाम कम हुआ है..(व्यवधान)..

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : तीन-चार दिन पहले दिल्ली में आलू बारह रुपए किलो बिक रहा था.. (व्यवधान)..टाइम्स ऑफ इंडिया में मुख्य मंत्री ने कंसीड किया है..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I shall just provide some information...(Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, please. (Interruptions) No running commentary, please.

श्रीमती वृन्दा कारत : सर, यह किसानों की पीड़ा की आवाज है..(व्यवधान)..

श्री शरद पवार : यह सच है, यह किसानों की पीड़ा है..(व्यवधान)..पोटेटो के प्राइसेस के नीचे हो गया है..(व्यवधान)..यह किसानों की पीड़ा है..(व्यवधान)..यह शिकायत मेरे पास ऑनरेबल चीफ मिनिस्टर ऑफ वेस्ट बंगाल ने लिखी है..(व्यवधान)..उन्होंने मेरे पास लिखकर भेजा है..(व्यवधान)..उनका लैटर अभी भी मेरे पास है, जो मैं आपको दिखा सकता हूँ..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, please. (Interruptions) Let him complete. I would allow you. Let him complete...(Interruptions)

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: Sir, what has he done for ...(Interruptions)..

श्रीमती वृन्दा कारत : किसानों की पीड़ा को सरकार की तरफ से ..(व्यवधान)..उसका दाम गिर रहा है..(व्यवधान)..यह कौन सी दलील है..(व्यवधान)..सर, आप देखिए..(व्यवधान)..किसान रो रहा है..(व्यवधान)..सरकार दावा कर रही है..(व्यवधान)..दाम गिर रहा है..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: You have made your point. Please take your seat. (Interruptions) You have made your point. Please take your seat. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: It was not the market price; it was distress sale. (Interruptions)

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Sir, these are perishable goods. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, farmers were forced to sell them at...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please, take your seat. (Interruptions)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: They were forced...(Interruptions)...

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: This is a wrong approach of the...(Interruptions)...

(Followed by 1k/ksk)

KSK/AKG/2.10/1K

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What the hon. Minister says...(Interruptions).

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, the Minister...(Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): This is not permitted...(Interruptions). Listen to the Minister. After that, if you want, I will allow you to ask clarifications...(Interruptions). Please take your seat...(Interruptions).

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : सर, वे घाव पर नमक रगड़ रहे हैं ... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभाध्यक्ष : रवि शंकर जी, आप बैठिए प्लीज़ ... (व्यवधान) ...

श्रीमती वृंदा कारत : सरकार इसका दावा करती है कि देखो हमने दाम कितना गिरा दिया। शरद जी, आपसे ऐसी उम्मीद बिल्कुल नहीं थी। ... (व्यवधान) ...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Brindaji, you are a senior Member. Please resume your seat.

श्री शरद पवार : मैं आपसे बिल्कुल सहमत हूँ कि यह किसान की पीड़ा है, क्योंकि दाम नीचे आ गए। इसलिए इसका कोई रास्ता निकालने की आवश्यकता है। इस तरह के सुझाव कुछ सरकारों की तरफ से मेरे पास आए हैं। खास तौर पर वेस्ट बंगाल गवर्नमेंट के पास से मुझे सुझाव आए हैं। वेस्ट बंगाल गवर्नमेंट ने मुझे बतलाया है कि इसके लिए एक रास्ता हो सकता है कि हम साउथ ईस्ट एशिया में एक्सपोर्ट करें, तो शायद यहाँ के किसानों को राहत मिलेगी। वह एक्सपोर्ट करने के लिए कुछ सुविधाएँ देने की आवश्यकता है, भारत सरकार की तरफ से कुछ मदद देने की आवश्यकता है। यह सुझाव वेस्ट बंगाल गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से मेरे पास आया है। इससे यह बात साबित होती है कि दाम नीचे आए हैं, मगर इस परिस्थिति में किसानों की मदद करने के लिए कुछ कदम उठाने की आवश्यकता है और हम कदम उठाएंगे।

THE LEADER OF THE OPPOSITION (SHRI ARUN JAITLEY): Sir, I am grateful that the hon. Minister has yielded. I only urge the Government to depend on authentic sources of information. Now, in the case the Government is unaware of what the ground situation is with regard to the prices of commodities, on the 25th of February, an authentic document, which is the Economic Survey of this Government, was presented before both the Houses of Parliament. Page 65 of your Economic Survey says, "During this year, high inflation was reported in the case of onions and potatoes among vegetables, pulses, rice and wheat." Page 69 now says, "Potatoes, onions, tapioca, tomatoes, peas green and brinjal were the highest contributors to the inflation in vegetables." And, the hon. Minister is telling us that potato prices in

the country are falling. The Economic Survey says that the potatoes are the contributor to inflation.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I entirely agree with that. That is about the whole year. According to the statement which I have made, there is a trend, the prices are going down and I can substantiate with two things...(Interruptions).

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: The Minister is misleading...(Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You may disagree...(Interruptions). No, nobody is permitted.

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR:*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Not permitted. It will not go on record.

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, it will not go on record. Don't waste your time...(Interruptions).

SHRI MOINUL HASSAN: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: I said, "Nothing will go on record except what the hon. Minister speaks."

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: *

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: *

SHRI N.K. SINGH: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: This is against the rule. This kind of interruption is not permitted...(Interruptions). I will allow you after the reply.

SHRI TAPAN KUMAR SEN: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): This is not going on record. Why are you wasting your time? I said I will allow clarifications....(Interruptions). It is not going on record. You please listen.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I would like to assure the hon. Members from West Bengal who have raised this issue to me that if there is a definite proposal from the Government of West Bengal for market intervention, there is a scheme with the Government of India where the Government of India can take financial responsibility just to protect the interest of the farmers who produce potato in West Bengal, or, Uttar Pradesh or any other State.

(continued by 11 - gsp)

GSP-SCH/1L/2.15

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.): I would like to tell the House in brief what steps we have taken mainly to augment supply, and, to monitor demand to cool the market sentiments which saw the rise in prices. While I will go into some specific details of the individual commodities later, I would like to bring out the broad thrust of the measures taken by the Government. To improve availability, a policy decision was taken to encourage imports while discouraging exports. In certain cases, subsidy has been given to the public sector units for the imports and distribution through the PDS in respect of some of the commodities, which I will elaborate upon.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, may I seek a clarification? (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: There has been a complete ban on export of some commodities. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: It is very important. I just want to ask why is it that the imported sugar.....(Interruptions).. Sir, the STC and NAFED.....(Interruptions)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): You cannot ask now. (Interruptions)

Brinda ji, you are not permitted to ask any question now. (Interruptions)

श्रीमती ब्रिन्दा कारत: अगर साथ-साथ पूछ लेंगे तो सवाल का जवाब भी साथ ही साथ मिल जाएगा।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Brinda ji, no, no. Please don't do this. (Interruptions) I will allow you after the reply is over. Please have patience to listen. (Interruptions)

You may not agree. So what? Take your seat. No, no. This is not correct. Allow the Minister to reply. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Just one issue. (Interruptions) Please, Sir, ..(Interruptions).. Sharadji, ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, no. I am not yielding. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Are you yielding, Mr. Minister? (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, Sir. I am not yielding. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: He is not yielding. Please take your seat. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, it is very unfortunate. ..(Interruptions).. The Standing Committee on Finance has specifically said that the State agencies played a very dubious role by not importing sugar and leaving it to the private trade. ..(Interruptions)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, no. Take your seat. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: What is this, Sir?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: You have said it. ..(Interruptions).. He is not yielding. Don't you know the Rules of the House? If he is not yielding, then, why do you go on speaking? ..(Interruptions).. Please don't do that. You are a senior Member. Please don't do like this. If he is not yielding, then, what is the purpose in speaking? ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, to ensure that the vulnerable sections of the society are protected, the Government of India has given considerable support to the public distribution system. An extremely important step in this direction has been to keep the central issue price constant at the year 2002 level. The issue prices of wheat and rice, which were fixed in the year 2002, till today, have not changed for the AAY, BPL and APL categories, which we have taken huge financial burden thereof.

श्रीमती ब्रिन्दा कारत: एपीएल को तो इन्होंने सिस्टम से बिल्कुल निकाल ही दिया है।

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: In fact, I recollect that about six years back when I took the responsibility of this particular department, the total subsidy Bill was somewhat Rs. 19,000 crores, which has now reached to somewhat Rs. 60,000 crores. That type of financial burden has been taken upon by the Government of India just to protect the

interests of the weaker sections of the society, and, this conscious decision has been taken by the Government of India. Despite the advance monsoon, the procurement of rice has also been good. As on 24th February, 2010, 22.78 million tonnes of rice has been procured in the *kharif* marketing season of the year 2009-10. As a result of which, the stocks of the foodgrains in the central pool continue to be comfortable with 206.23 lakh tonnes of wheat and 226.52 lakh tonne of rice. This is as on 1st February, 2010 and it is much more than the buffer stock. A point was raised here as to why the buffer stock was not maintained. This was much more than the buffer stock norms, and, that is why, on this particular situation, the position is quite comfortable.

(Contd. by YSR-1M)

-GSP/YSR-PSV/2.20/1M

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.): Modifications have been made to the orders issued under the Essential Commodities Act to provide powers to the State Governments to fix and enforce stock limits for several essential commodities. This would help to contain hoarding of these commodities. These are some of the steps which the Government of India has definitely taken.

In the current year, delayed monsoon and floods have definitely created some problems. Hon. Members are aware that in the beginning of this kharif season, there were 324 districts in 14 States where the State Government has declared drought, and there are some districts particularly in Karnataka, Maharashtra and Andhra Pradesh which had been affected with floods. Kharif is a major crop on which the country always depends. But this year because of the drought situation and because of the flood situation in some of the States, in some of the districts, our production has been affected and that has sent a wrong signal to the market and we have seen some changes in the prices.

One of the important issues has been raised by some of the hon. Members about annual rate of inflation in food articles, particularly in the current year, of about 17.58 per cent. Of course, this is a matter of concern. Thus, although the annual

rate of inflation based on the monthly WPI stood at 8.56 per cent for the month of January 2010, the high inflation in food articles is certainly disturbing.

Hon. Leader of the Opposition, Shri Arun Jaitley, has mentioned about the divergence between the Wholesale Price Index and the Consumer Price Index. While the Finance Ministry works on this issue and works towards their convergence, at this point we have to base our arguments on two indices. However, Sir, it must be seen that if we see the food inflation in the WPI, we find it much more than the WPI all commodities index and somewhat comparable to the Consumer Price Index.

Shri Jaitley and other hon. Members also referred to the higher inflation in India as compared to other countries. I have collected the information and I have also collected the Report of the FAO. The Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations has said the inflation rate in India is more or less the same. In fact, it is slightly lower. The FAO index shows an inflation of 19.44 per cent for December 2009 as compared to January 2009. In the same period, WPI-based index for the food inflation in India was 18.25 per cent. This is the Report of the FAO. Outside India also situation is practically same. (Interruptions) There are some countries where the situation might be different. (Interruptions) But we have seen the situation is same. (Interruptions) Though there was an increase in the total production of foodgrains in 2008-09, production of some of the items, some of the varieties of pulses and sugar had been definitely lower. In the year 2009-10, the second advance estimates of production of the major agricultural crop shows that the production of foodgrains for the year 2009-10 will be 216.85 million tonnes despite the major drought. As I said earlier, the kharif season was not good. But luckily for us, Rabi prospects seem to be very bright and as per the information which I got about sowing operation whether it is oilseeds, whether it is pulses, whether it is rice or whether it is wheat...

(Contd. By VKK/1N)

-YSR/VKK-DS/1n/2.25

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.):I am absolutely confident that in this *rabi* season, the overall production will be much improved and the overall situation in respect of prices...(Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, only statistics are given. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Take your seat. (Interruptions) Allow him to reply. (Interruptions) Let him speak. (Interruptions) Please, let him reply. (Interruptions) Please sit down. (Interruptions)

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, rather than giving some statistics, he should come out with proposals. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please, don't be impatience. (Interruptions)

SHRI BIRENDRA PRASAD BAISHYA: Same figures were given in the month of October also.

उपसभाध्यक्ष: आप बैठिए। आप तो इतने सीनियर मेम्बर हैं, आप बैठिए।..(व्यवधान)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: As I said, the *rabi* position seems to be quite encouraging. This has not just happened. To boost production, the Minimum Support Price of wheat has been increased from Rs.640 per quintal (Interruptions) to Rs.1100 per quintal. In 2004, the price of wheat in this country which was fixed by the Government of India was Rs.640 per quintal. Today, this Government has taken a decision to fix the price at Rs.1100 per quintal for the farmers who produce wheat. (Interruptions)

SHRI VIKRAM VERMA: What is price of fertilisers, diesel, petrol, etc.? किसान को जो पेट्रोल लगता है, उसका आप रेट तो बताइए। ..(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please don't disturb. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, in case of paddy common variety, the Minimum Support Price has been increased from Rs.560 per quintal to Rs.1000 per quintal. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Brindaji, please listen. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Despite the huge cost to the Government, the MSP for wheat has been enhanced by 72 per cent and the MSP for paddy has been enhanced by 79 per cent. So, this type of pro-farmer decision has been taken. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): No, no. Please, no running commentaries. (Interruptions) No, Mr. Sarkar, take your seat. (Interruptions)

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Then, you can easily universalise the PDS! (Interruptions) What is the harm? (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. Sarkar, please take your seat. (Interruptions) Mr. Minister, one second please. I have already announced that after the Minister's reply is over, I will allow clarifications. (Interruptions) No, no. Please. (Interruptions) So, there is no justification for this kind of running commentary. (Interruptions) Please don't do that. (Interruptions)

SHRI RAJNITI PRASAD: We are not making running commentary. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: You take your seat. (Interruptions) I will allow you. आप बैठिए। (Interruption)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, the increase of Minimum Support Price has definitely helped the farmers and the rural economy of this country. The increase in MSP has definitely seen increase in production throughout the year and it is only on the strength of the increased production that increased demand on account of rising population and rising income level has been met. In fact, we took the decision of Rs.1000 per quintal for paddy or Rs.1100 per quintal for wheat. This ultimately shows a sort of benchmark in open market. So, prices will not go below Rs.1100 or Rs.1000 because the Government itself is purchasing and providing Rs.1000 per quintal for paddy. You should not forget when we provided Rs.1000 per 100 kilogram of paddy after processing....(Interruptions)....

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, the Minister is justifying what he is doing. (Interruptions)

(Followed by MKS/1o)

MKS-AKA/2.30/10

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN):_Only what the Minister says will go on record. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: It is not going on record. Take your seat. ...(Interruptions)... That is not going on record. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: *

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Only what the Minister says is going on record. Please take your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU:*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. Madhu, 'madhu' means honey! You sit down. ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: I am giving you the facts.....(Interruptions)...

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: He is answering your queries. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. Madhu, please take your seat. ...(Interruptions)... You are such a good man. Please sit down. ...(Interruptions)...

* Not recorded.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, please ask him to yield for a minute.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: The Minister is not yielding, Sir. ...(Interruption)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please take your seat.

...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: You can ask it after the reply is over. ...(Interruptions)...

After the reply, I am allowing you. Please listen to him.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: It is a simple thing. You see.....(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please listen to him. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: *

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: ...when I said we have given some Rs.640/- -- Rs.1100/- price for wheat, but we have not changed the price, the Central Issue Price, for the PDS. That shows.....(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: *

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: That shows.....(Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: *

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: What has your Government done during the last three years? ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

SHRI B.K. HARIPRASAD: *

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: From the year 2000.....(Interruptions)... They are not listening to it, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

* Not recorded.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

SHRI PRAKASH JAVADEKAR: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Take your seats. ...(Interruption)... Take your seat. ...(Interruption)... Please hear him. ...(Interruptions)... All of you, please take your seats. ...(Interruptions)... All of you take your seats. ...(Interruptions)... Please take your seat. ...(Interruption).. Please take your seat. Only what the hon. Minister says will go on record. Nothing else will go on record except the hon. Minister. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Why do you do this? ...(Interruptions)... I will give you time. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, I will give you time after the reply is over. ...(Interruptions)... This is indiscipline. ...(Interruptions)... This is indiscipline. ...(Interruptions)... After the reply is over, I will give you time. Why do you interrupt?

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please take your seats. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vijayaraghavan, see, ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, see, the Minister or any Member will speak according to that Member's desire, not according to your desire. You take your seat. ...(Interruption)... Take your seat.

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: *

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. Madhu, I told you.....(Interruptions)...

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, please ask him to yield for a minute. ...(Interruptions)...

* Not recorded.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Minister, are you yielding for Brinda Karatji?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: He is not yielding. What can I do?

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Then, you should protect me, Sir, because it concerns the people.....(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: I will allow you immediately after the reply. ... (Interruptions)... Immediately after the reply, I will allow you. That is the way. ... (Interruptions)... That is the way. ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, I seek answers for my queries. ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Mr. Vijayaraghavan, listen to him. ... (Interruptions)... Mr. Vijayaraghavan, why do you want that? ... (Interruptions)... You are a disciplined Member; so disciplined. ... (Interruptions)... Show some discipline. ... (Interruptions)... Show some discipline.

SHRI MATILAL SARKAR: Sir, we are here for the people.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, increasing MSP was a conscious decision of this Government. In fact, when the Government came in power, we had announced the Common Minimum Programme, and in the Common Minimum Programme, there is a commitment from the Government that the terms of trade will be in favour of the farming community. (Contd. by TMV/1P)

-MKS-TMV-NB/1P/2.35

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD.): If the terms of the trade should be in favour of the farming community there has to be some good prices (Interruptions)....

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir,... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: What is this Mr. Raja? (Interruptions).... You would not write his reply. (Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Some good prices have been provided and when.... (Interruptions)...

SHRI D. RAJA: That is what I am saying. (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN) : After he finishes. (Interruptions)... I will give you time after he finishes. (Interruptions)... I promise you all that I will give you time. (Interruptions)... But you don't trust me. (Interruptions)... Take your seats. (Interruptions)... I will give you time. (Interruptions)... Take your seats. (Interruptions)... No, Mr. Mysoora Reddy. That is not going on record. (Interruptions)... That is not going on record. (Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Increased production is a must for the food security of the nation and the correct price signal to the farmer through enhanced MSP is a step in the right direction. The step has been taken just to support the farming community and just to improve the production. When you enhance the Minimum Support Price there is some impact on the market which you can't deny. (Interruptions)...

श्रीमती वृन्दा कारत : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, यहां किसानों के नाम पर price rise का justification हो रहा है।

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, as I had mentioned earlier, steps have been taken to insulate the vulnerable sections of the society from this rise to the extent possible. I don't want to take more time on this particular subject because I have already explained it. There are certain other items which are raised here and, I think, I should try to give more information about some of those items. Take the case of rice and wheat. The Government has had record procurement last year and the trend is expected to continue in the current year. What I said about the overall prospects of the rabi season is that the stocks of wheat and rice are, therefore, sufficient to meet the demand of the public distribution system and all other welfare schemes and to ensure availability and check prices, apart from the requirement of the public distribution system, the Government has been releasing stocks through open market scheme. (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Twenty lakh tonnes of wheat and ten lakh tonnes of rice were allocated during October, 2009-March, 2010 to the State Governments for distribution to retail consumers. (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: At what price? (Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: The State Governments are to ensure adequate lifting so that the open market price is kept under check. (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Please listen to him. (Interruptions).... Please listen to him. (Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: In addition 20.8 lakh tonnes of wheat has been allocated for bulk users. (Interruptions).... This is being sold by tenders. (Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: At what price? (Interruptions)...

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : कितनी कीमत पर freight charge किया? गेहूं की कीमत 15 रुपए किलो हो गई ... (व्यवधान)

श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालिया : कॉमन मैन के लिए क्या है?

श्री तारिक अनवर : PDS किसको मिलता है? क्या आप लेते हैं PDS से ... (व्यवधान)

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : अगर सारी जिम्मेदारी राज्यों की है, तो केन्द्र सरकार की जिम्मेदारी क्या है?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: An additional allocation of wheat and rice of 10 kilograms per head for the month of January and February have also been given to the accepted numbers of AAY, BPL and APL.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: At what cost? (Interruptions).... That is only for AAY and BPL cardholders. What about those who don't have the card? (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, please. (Interruptions).... Please.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: This is in addition to the existing allocation. (Interruptions).... The States would definitely use ... (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, ... (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, please. (Interruptions)... No, please. (Interruptions)... You listen to him. (Interruptions)... You listen to his full speech. (Interruptions)... No. Listen to the full speech. (Interruptions)...

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, whatever he says is a repetition of his earlier reply. (Interruptions)... What is the new proposal? That is important. (Interruptions)... Whatever he is telling us is what he has said in his earlier replies. There is no new proposal. (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Yes, you wait. (Interruptions)... You sit down. (Interruptions)... You have to listen to him. That is what I am saying. (Interruptions)...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: I am raising a question. What is the normal rate for APL, BPL and AAY? (Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No. You are a senior Member. (Interruptions)... You have to listen to the Minister.

(CONTD. by 1Q/RG)

-NB/VNK-RG/1Q/2.40

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (CONTD.): Ahluwaliaji, I will allow you. You can seek your clarifications later on...(Interruptions)

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: People are expecting some assurances from the hon. Minister. That is lacking in the reply...(Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please sit down...(Interruptions) This is indiscipline...(Interruptions) Do not cross the *Lakshman Rekha*. Nobody should cross the *Lakshman Rekha*...(Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, the issues which have been raised, again and again, are about the APL price, BPL price and the AAY price. I said in my statement that since the year 2002, we have not changed the prices. The prices, which have been finalised in the year 2002, have remained the same...(Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: All of you kindly take your seats...(Interruptions) Please take your seat...(Interruptions) Mr. Tariq Anwar, please take your seat...(Interruptions) Mr. Vijayaraghavan, please take your seat...(Interruptions) I

am on my legs. Please take your seat...(Interruptions) Don't you know the rules? You should, at least, have some respect for the rules of the House...(Interruptions)

श्री कमाल अख्तर : सर, हम लोगों को आपका संरक्षण चाहिए ..(व्यवधान)..

उपसभाध्यक्ष : कृपया आप बैठिए। (Interruptions) Mr. Madhu, I am on my legs...(Interruptions) I am aware that the Members are agitated about price rise. I am also equally concerned about it...(Interruptions) But, let me tell you; the other day, the discussion, that went on, was in perfect order, and whatever was spoken in the House was listened to carefully...(Interruptions) Don't you know the rules? I am on my legs. Don't break the rules...(Interruptions) Don't cross the *Lakshman Rekha*. I am on my legs. Now, listen to me. Therefore, it is the responsibility of this august House to listen to the Minister. After I have assured you from the Chair that after the reply is over, I will give time to those who want to seek clarifications, wait till that time. Maybe, in a few minutes, he will finish...(Interruptions) No; sit down. If it proceeds this way, then, I will have to adjourn the House...(Interruptions) Mr. Madhu, just a minute...(Interruptions) Please take your seat. I am on my legs.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: We are here to honour your words. We are here to listen to the hon. Minister. We never want to disturb the proceedings...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Then, what do you want?

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: We do not want to disrupt the proceedings....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Then, please sit down.

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: But our only request is, we have raised certain issues...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: I have said that I will allow you to seek further clarifications...(Interruptions)

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU: *

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No; no; nothing will go on record...(Interruptions) Please sit down...(Interruptions) Please take your seat...(Interruptions) What is this?(Interruptions) In this way, I will adjourn the House.

(Continued by 1R)

1r/2.45/mp-ks

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN : Show that seriousness. You say it is very serious and you

* Not recorded

are not showing that seriousness now. (Interruptions) Please. If you are serious, you will listen to the reply. And after that.... (Interruptions) No, Brindaji, don't do this. (Interruptions) I will adjourn the House. (Interruptions) Don't force me to adjourn the House. (Interruptions) No, no. After the reply. (Interruptions) After the reply. (Interruptions) I will give you the time after the reply. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, questions raised by hon. Members in the course of the discussion should be answered.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): : If he does not reply, I will give you the opportunity. (Interruptions) He will not violate. (Interruptions) If he doesn't reply, I will

give you the time. (Interruptions) Please. I am helpless. (Interruptions) No, no. Please. What can I do if all of you stand up like this? (Interruptions) Mr. Raja, what is this? If all of you stand up, what can I do? (Interruptions) You make them sit.

(Interruptions) You ask your people to sit. (Interruptions) If you want to say something, first ask them to sit. (Interruptions)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, we want specific response. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please, please. (Interruptions) Nobody is hearing anything. (Interruptions)

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, we agree that the whole House is agitated on the issue of price rise.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (P: What do you want now?

SHRI D. RAJA: Our simple submission is this. What action is the Government taking to control the prices?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN : But you allow him to say that. (Interruptions) Take your seat. (Interruptions) Mr. Sarkar! Please take your seat. (Interruptions) Sit down. (Interruptions) Sit down.

SHRI D. RAJA: Sir, tell us what action has the Government taken. (Interruptions)
The Government is only trying to justify the price rise. But we want to know the action that it has taken.

SHRI A. VIJAYARAGHAVAN: Sir, so far, he has only tried to justify the price rise.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): : Mr. Vijayaraghavan, you say...
(Interruptions) No, no. (Interruptions) Mr. Brijesh, I am on my legs.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : मैं एक विशेष बात बताना चाहता हूँ।(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, no. You see my plight. (Interruptions) I will tell you...
(Interruptions)

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : मैं एक विशेष बात बताना चाहता हूँ। वह विशेष बात यह है कि माननीय मंत्री जी ..(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, please. (Interruptions) Please. आप लोग बैठिए.... प्लीज...
(व्यवधान)... No. sit down. (Interruptions) Take your seat.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : सर, आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)... सर, आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: You sit down.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : मैं समझ रहा हूँ कि आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं। ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Take your seat. आप बैठिए। ...(व्यवधान)... Ask him to sit.
बैठिए। (Interruptions) I am on my legs. आप बैठिए। ..(व्यवधान)...

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : सर, आप भी...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: You sit down.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : आप भी महंगाई से जूझ रहे हैं। आप इनकी तरफ मत जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)...

अपने परिवार का ख्याल रखिए हुजूर। ..(व्यवधान)...

श्री राजीव शुक्ल : वे तो चैन से बैठे हैं, आपका परिवार बहुत बड़ा है।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: I am on my legs. (Interruptions) Ask him to sit.

श्री बृजभूषण तिवारी : नहीं, एक क्लैरिफिकेशन ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please listen. All of you are hon. Members of the House. You know the rule. When a Minister is speaking or, for that matter, any hon. Member is

speaking, if you want to put a question, first the one who is speaking should yield. That is number one. Here, the Minister said he was not yielding. All of you stand up for seeking clarifications. You tell me what the Chair should do. Do you want the Chair to break the rules? (Interruptions) You sit down.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : माननीय मंत्री जी से ही ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Sit down. I am on my legs. What is this?

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : माननीय मंत्री जी से कहिए कि सही जवाब दें।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: I will name you. You sit down. (Interruptions) I will be forced to name you. (Interruptions) Take your seat.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : ये सही जवाब देंगे तो कोई दिक्कत नहीं होगी।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: I will be forced to name you. Take your seat.

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : बिल्कुल कीजिए। मुझे क्या दिक्कत है? मुझे देश की जनता ने भेजा है, मैं अपनी बात रखूंगा। माननीय मंत्री जी अगर सही बोलेंगे ...(व्यवधान)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Do you want me to name you? Sit down.

(Followed by 1s/tdb)

TDB-SC/1S/2.50

श्री ब्रजेश पाठक : देश की जनता के हित में बोलेंगे तो हम चुपचाप सुनेंगे...(व्यवधान).. इस तरीके से चुपचाप सुनने वाले नहीं हैं।...(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Do you want me to name you? ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... What is this? ...(Interruptions)... Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... I will ask him whether he is yielding. ...(Interruptions)... Mr. Minister, are you yielding to Brindaji because she wants to ask a question?

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: No, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, he is not yielding. He is just...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Pardon! ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Having replied all the queries, last when I finish my reply...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: He is not yielding, Brindaji. You wait. Have patience. No, Brindaji, please. No, no; I cannot help. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: All right, Sir.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I don't want to break the rules. Sit down. ...(Interruptions)... I am helpless. Now, sit down. ...(Interruptions)... What are you doing? He is not yielding. Sit down. It is up to him. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, as I said, whatever the normal...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, during the debate, we have raised very specific questions. ...(Interruptions)... He has not replied a single question. Because there is no clarification now...(Interruptions)... We have asked clarifications in our interventions at the time of the debate, Sir. But, he is not answering a single question, we have asked. For example, why is APL allocation being cut when you have got the stock? But, he is not answering that question. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, in your State 90 per cent of the allocation is cut. ...(Interruptions)...

श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया : सर, मैं शुद्ध हिन्दी में बोलता हूँ। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री तारिक अनवर : आप मत बोलिए। ..(व्यवधान).. आप डिस्टर्ब मत करिए। ..(व्यवधान)..

श्री एस.एस.अहलुवालिया : मैं शुद्ध हिन्दी में बोलता हूँ। महंगाई पर जब चर्चा हुई तो यह बजट के पहले की घटना है। महंगाई पर चर्चा सिर्फ इसीलिए की गयी थी ताकि इस पर अंकुश लगे, चीजों की कीमत कम हो। हम उम्मीद करते थे कि मंत्री महोदय जब तक जवाब देंगे, चीजें सस्ती हो जाएंगी। इसी बीच बजट आ गया, तेल की कीमत बढ़ गयी, पेट्रोल और डीज़ल की कीमत बढ़ गयी और महंगाई और ऊपर चली गयी। ..(व्यवधान).. क्या मंत्री महोदय बताएंगे कि महंगाई कम कैसे होगी और क्या डीज़ल और पेट्रोल का दाम वापस होगा या नहीं होगा? ..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Only what the Minister says will go on record, nothing else. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: As I said, whatever the requirements of the States, according to the APL, BPL and AAY quota, Government has decided to supply it to all the States.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: At what price?

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is the price? Again, he is misleading the House.
...(Interruptions)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He has replied that. ...(Interruptions)..
He has replied that. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: He is misleading the House. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: As I said...(Interruptions)...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: What is the price?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: He said that but you did not hear. He has said 'the old price 2002 '. ...(Interruptions).... He said that.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: He is misleading the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: The problem is, you are not listening...(Interruptions)....He replied to that query.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, when I said, as per the quota, we do supply to BPL, AAY and APL, I also said the prices which were fixed in the year 2002, till today, we have not changed the issue prices. We are charging the same prices which were fixed in the year 2002. ...(Interruptions).... Now, the question comes about as to what exactly we have done. ...(Interruptions)...

श्रीमती बृन्दा कारत : एपीएल की बात कीजिए। ..(ब्यवधान) ..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: No, he has answered that query. Sit down.
...(Interruptions)...

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: See the additional thing. ...(Interruptions).... When I said that we have given additional quota to the States to sell it in the open market. When we sell it in the open market, our desire is that it should be available. Firstly, availability should be improved in the State. ...(Interruptions).... Number two, the flour mills and others should get sufficient wheat in the open market. At what rate we have charged it, Sir?. We have fixed the rate for them is somewhat at the MSP we have paid to the farmers. We have not earned any money; we have not earned any profit. In fact, we have lost. Even for that section also, the price which we have fixed

is somewhat at the MSP price. Beyond that, we have not charged any money.

...(Interruptions)...

(Followed by 1t-kgg)

KGG/MCM/1T/2.55

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : चीनी का दाम प्रति के०जी० कितना है और किसान को कितना मिलता है, यह मैंने पूछा था?.....(व्यवधान)

श्री शरद पवार : आपका जो कहना है, इसको स्वीकार करना मुझे मुश्किल है, क्योंकि बी०पी०एल० का जो रेट है वह हम फ्लोर मिल के रेट पर नहीं देंगे। फ्लोर मिल के लिए अलग रेट होगा।.....(व्यवधान)

श्री भगत सिंह कोश्यारी : पहले क्या प्राइस था?.....(व्यवधान) बिल्कुल यह मिस-लीडिंग कर रहे हैं ये।.....(व्यवधान) He is misleading the House. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): After he finishes you can say that. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Whatever rates have been finalised; additional stocks have been allocated to the States. (Interruptions) As I said, at the MSP price. This is the additional quota for flour mills and others. (Interruptions)

श्रीमती वृंदा कारत : सर, बी०पी०एल० क्या है आज?.....(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): He has already said about the prices, they are at 2002 prices. You know that, please sit down. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: The second important issue... (Interruptions) When the question comes to improve the availability in the open market, nobody expects that the Government of India should sell to the open market at the BPL rates. That is a different situation. BPL is only for those people who come from below the poverty-line. But, if anybody wants can buy wheat at the flour mill price; the flour mill owner should not expect the we should supply him at the BPL rate.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Sir, about below poverty-line, there are five definitions. One is of the Central Government, one is of Planning Commission, one is of Consumer Affairs, one is of the Finance Ministry, the other is of the State. There are five

different definitions. At least, right from Lakrawala to... (Interruptions) Who will ensure?

श्री तारिक अनवर : आपने एनडीए के टाइम में क्यों ठीक नहीं किया?.....(व्यवधान) तभी सूची को ठीक कर देते।.....(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Tariq, you do not worry. Please sit down. (Interruptions)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, another important issue that has been raised in the House is about the edible oil. In fact, India annually imports about 40 per cent. (Interruptions)

श्रीमती वृंदा कारत : बीपीएल के नाम पर इन लोगों को विभाजित करके उनको वंचित किया जा रहा है खाद्य सुरक्षा से।.....(व्यवधान)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Sir, we have taken many steps. Firstly, whatever shortfall is there, it will be imported. We have removed all taxes and duties of the imports. We have banned export of all types of edible oils to make the availability. In order to relieve the consumer, the Government of India told some of the Public Sector Units to import edible oil and we have provided up to Rs.25 per litre subsidy and that edible oil has been available in the public distribution system. Many States have taken the benefit.

Another important issue which has been raised here is about sugar.

श्रीमती वृंदा कारत : सर, दाल में काला है, चीनी में घोटाला है।.....(व्यवधान)

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: In fact, sugar availability is about 150 lakh tonnes this year. As I said, this year, the production will be nearer to 160 lakh tonnes. The estimated demand will be 230 lakh tonnes.

(Contd. by kls/1u)

GS/KLS/1u/3.00

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR (CONTD): There is a shortfall. ...(Interruptions)... There is a shortfall between demand and supply. ...(Interruptions).. We have taken many steps. Firstly, we have allowed import of raw sugar and other sugars without Duty.

..(Interruptions).. We have banned export. ..(Interruptions).. Therefore, the availability of sugar has definitely improved. The prices which had gone up to Rs.48 in retail have come down between Rs.38 and Rs.41 as on today. One of the reasons, (a) production is definitely improving and import has definitely eased the situation..(Interruptions) I am sure that will definitely improve the situation. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, I have a point of order. ...(Interruptions).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Minister, there is a point of order. ..(Interruptions).. Dr. Maitreya, please sit down. ..(Interruptions).. Under what Rule?

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Sir, Rule 169. When we discuss matters of urgent public interest, the Rule 169.1 says, it shall raise substantially one definite issue. Then in 170, you decide the admissibility and there is reply. When we raised a question of importance, the hon. Minister is obliged to reply to the issues raised by us. And all of us have raised the issue of great scam in sugar. I have given statistics. He is not replying to that and he is saying that everything is fine in sugar. ..(Interruptions).. Is it right, Sir? ..(Interruptions).. He is evading the issue. ..(Interruptions).. He must reply to the issues raised. ..(Interruptions)..

श्री रघुनन्दन शर्मा : चीनी में बहुत बड़ा घोटाला किया है। ..(व्यवधान)।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please take your seat. I will give my ruling. Please take your seats.

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : मंत्री जी, मैंने सवाल किया था। आप बताइए कि पिछले साल चीनी की कितनी पैदावार हुई थी और चीनी के दाम क्या थे ? ..(व्यवधान)।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: The hon. Member who raised the point of order is a very senior Member and he is well-versed with the proceedings and rules of the House. He knows that the Chair cannot direct a Member and for that matter a Minister to reply in a particular way. ..(Interruptions)..

श्री रवि शंकर प्रसाद : आप बैठ जाइए। आप बैठ जाइए। ..(व्यवधान)। उसका जवाब दीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)। The Minister is flouting the rules.

श्री तारिक अनवर : जवाब देने नहीं देंगे और कहेंगे कि जवाब दीजिए। ..(व्यवधान)।

श्री बृजभूषण तिवारी : जो मुद्दे, जो सवाल उठाए गए हैं, उनका जवाब नहीं होगा, तो बहस करने का मतलब क्या रह जाएगा ? ..(व्यवधान)..

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: He is misleading the House.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): I will tell you. ..(Interruptions).. I will come to that

श्री कमाल अख्तर : सर, रूल्स का पालन करवाइये। ..(व्यवधान)..

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: The hon. Deputy Leader of the Opposition is saying that the Minister is misleading the House. If the Minister is misleading the House, ..(Interruptions).. Please, sit down. I am nobody to judge here whether he is misleading or not. If you think, he is misleading the House, there are rules in this Rule Book by which you can take it up. ..(Interruptions) That is up to you.

श्री नारायण सिंह केसरी : सर, आपके सामने मिसलीड कर रहे हैं। ..(व्यवधान)..

(Followed by 1W/SSS)

SSS/1W/3.05

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: That is up to you. (Interruptions) Please..(Interruptions)...From the chair, I am not directed to do this way or that way but there are rules for everything and hon. Deputy Leader of the Opposition can go through the rules and take proper action. (Interruptions) Please...

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (SHRI SHARAD PAWAR): When I say...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: Please...(Interruptions)...Why Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad....

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: Before I spoke, Shrimati Brinda Karat spoke on this. Both of us talked about sugar scam. Why is he not replying to that? That is the question I am asking. That is the issue. We have raised a definite issue of public importance. Has he replied to that? He is evading that. (Interruptions)

SHRI TARIQ ANWAR: He is replying to your queries. (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: In the course of the debate, we have raised very specific issues. Now, the Minister has not answered a single question which we

have raised now. Sir, we are seeking clarifications. What is the point? We have asked so many times. He has not replied. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P. J. KURIEN): He is replying to that. Now listen to the reply. (Interruptions) Nothing will go on record. Only the Minister's reply will go on record.

SHRI SHARAD PAWAR: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, as I said, the total production of sugar in this country will be 160 lakh tonnes. We have a carry-over of about 25 lakh tonnes. So, we have got about 185 lakh tonnes. So, there is a shortfall of about 50-63 lakh tonnes. So, the question was how to resolve this issue....(Interruptions)... We took a conscious decision just to see that the availability is improved. We have taken a decision to remove all restrictions of import, whether it is raw sugar or whether it is a *pucca* sugar. In fact, in the information which we have got, more than 50 lakh tonnes of sugar has already been imported and it has come to India. In such a situation when some hon. Members say that there is some scam or anything, I would like to tell one thing to the House that not a single kilo has been imported by the Government of India and not a single kilo has been sold by the Government of India. (Interruptions) Whatever statements they are making here have no meaning and that is how we try our level best to improve the supply position (Interruptions) and I recollect last week (Interruptions) to the householders (Interruptions) to enhance the price of sugarcane. Then, Government of India took a decision to enhance the price of the sugar cane. We have decided...(Interruptions)... So, whether it is *cheeni*, whether it is pulses, whether it is edible oil, in all the areas, Government of India has taken a decision to resolve this issue and we have seen that the prices of pulses and major pulses are coming down. The situation will be improved in the coming days. (Interruptions)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned to meet at 4.00 P.M.

...

The House then adjourned at nine minutes
past three of the clock.

-SSS/NBR-LT/1X/4.00.

The House re-assembled at four of the clock,
MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, let us take up the Motion of Thank on President's Address. Prof. P.J. Kurien to move the Motion.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (KERALA): Sir, I move...

SHRI M. RAMA JOIS (KARNATAKA): Sir, before my friend moves the Motion, I wish to make a submission. My submission is, we should not criticise the Address of the hon. President. The Address is that of the Government. So, we must thank the hon. President unanimously. That is what Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru said and I quote, "The President's Address is a statement of policy of the Government. It should be remembered; it is the Government that is responsible for it and it is not right or proper for our respected President's name to be brought in debates like this." But, unfortunately, this is going on. Sir, 614 amendments expressing regrets have been moved. So, my humble submission is, we should thank the hon. President unanimously and go on debate about the policies and programmes of the Government. Thank you.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jois, your point is well taken. It needs discussion. There has to be a wider discussion on this point.

Now, Shri P.J. Kurien to move the Motion.

MOTION OF THANKS ON PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (KERALA): Mr. Deputy Chairman, Sir, I beg to move:

That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:

"That the Members of the Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which she has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on February 22, 2010."

Sir, I consider it a privilege to have the opportunity of moving this Motion. I thank the Chair, the leadership of my party and my leader for allowing me to move this Motion.

I am doing it with a sense of satisfaction, because I am convinced that I am arguing a case which is very strong and which can be justified with all the ground realities. If one carefully reads the Address of the hon. President made to the Joint Session of Parliament, one will be convinced that our gratitude is due to the President, because whatever is said in the Address and whatever achievements of the UPA Government narrated in the Address are borne by the facts. Whatever expectations are there from the Address are justified when we see the Budget that was already presented.

Sir, before every Budget Session of Parliament, the hon. President Addresses the Joint Session of Parliament and there is a Motion of Thanks moved in both the Houses. It is a customary process. All those on the Treasury Benches will support the Address, whatever may be the content. And, all those on the other side will move amendments. This has been going on. But, apart from that, what I feel is, instead of going like this in a customary way, why not we look at the contents of the Address objectively and debate on it.

(CONTD. BY USY "1Y")

-NBR-USY/AKG/1Y/4.05

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (CONTD.): My hon. friend, Shri M. Rama Jois, just now, raised a point that the Motion of Thanks to the President should be passed unanimously; it should not be discussed. In a way, I agree with him. This should certainly be passed unanimously. The House should pass it unanimously instead of moving amendments to the speech of the President. But I would like to submit this Motion can be passed unanimously because of the contents itself. But you are saying that the contents should not be discussed, we should pass it without that. My argument is that even if you go through the contents objectively, there can be unanimity.

What is the point to which the other side cannot agree? All the achievements, which have been narrated in it, are borne by the facts; and, all what has been stated are the programmes of action. They are seeing that they are being implemented. So, there should be unanimity. But unanimity can be there only if all of us are ready to look into the speech with an open mind. If it is not with an open mind, then, there cannot be any unanimity. So, my submission to the House is that let us all go through the speech with an open mind so that we arrive at a consensus, a unanimous resolution. If it is not with an open mind, then, I can't help. There is a saying that a person who sleeps can be woken up, but if a person is pretending to sleep, it is very difficult to wake him up. Therefore, I am pleading that let us all have an objective look into the speech. That's all.

Sir, from the Opposition side, there will always be amendments saying, "However, we regret....", and all that. What is interesting is that one amendment has come from none other than Shri Anant Rao Joshi, hon. Member is not here. His amendment is supporting the speech. He says that he appreciates that the President has delivered the speech and he has narrated the reasons for that. He further says that he does not agree with the contents of the speech, but he appreciates the speech of the President. I think, that should be the spirit. I can cite any number of points to prove my point that this speech by the President should be unanimously accepted and the Motion of Thanks should be passed unanimously. But for the lack of time, I don't want to dwell on all those points. I will concentrate on one or two important points that I consider to be very important. Having said so much, Sir, I would like to quote from the third paragraph of the President's Address. I quote, "My Government was voted to office with a clear cut mandate to protect and deepen the values of pluralism and secularism and to ensure rapid growth with justice and fairness for all." But this sentence is being distorted. In my view, this sentence is an essence of what is inside the speech. The Bhagwat Gita can be condensed in one *shloka*, "कर्मण्येवाधिकारस्ते माफलेषु कदाचन्". That condenses the Bhagwat Gita.

SHRI D. RAJA: What is its meaning?

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: I know you know the meaning. But still I would try to explain it. It means, "Do your duty without desiring for the results". (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Rangarajan, please let him speak.

(Followed by 1z -- PK)

-USY/PK/1z/4.10

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: I said only this. Likewise, in my view this very sentence includes the essence of the speech. Number one is, My Government is voted to office with a clear-cut mandate to protect and deepen the values of pluralism, that is the responsibility of the Government. Secondly, to project and deepen the values of secularism; that is the responsibility of the Government. Thirdly, to ensure rapid growth; faster growth; then, growth with justice and fairness for all; that means inclusive growth. All these four are included in this. Sir, I believe, without any fear of contradiction, I can say that this Government has taken all steps to fulfil this mandate.

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, I would like to make one point. One of the greatest artists of India, Hussain, is not able to come back to this country. Can you just tell us what your Government is doing? ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is his point of view. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI BALBIR PUNJ: What about Ms. Taslima Nasreen ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Punj, you make this point when you speak on the subject. ..(Interruptions).. Mr. Kurien is expressing his opinion on the Motion of Thanks. Let him. Why are you interrupting him?

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Anyhow, Brindaji, I am not the Minister. Don't put me such questions. ..(Interruptions)..

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, please. Mr. Kurien, please carry on. PROF. P.J.

KURIEN: Sir, the first point I said was that there were four cardinal points in this. First is pluralism. It is the bounden duty of the Government to protect and deepen the values of pluralism. Sir, India is a pluralistic country. You travel from North to

South, from Kashmir to Kanya Kumari, what a kind of diversity is there. You will be awed with the diversity which you are seeing, yet there is an underlining unity, that is the beauty of India. Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru said, unity in diversity is the uniqueness of India. So, this underlining unity should be preserved. How to preserve that? We can preserve that not by making all these diversities uniform, but by strengthening and protecting these diversities. Sir, it is like a garland, a garland made of disparate flowers and different colours. Each flower and colour adds to the beauty of the garland. Likewise, each culture, each place, each point of diversity adds to the beauty of the nation and strengthens the nation. Sir, any attempt to make it uniform will be against the interests of the nation. That is what I am saying. This Government is trying to strengthen and protect this diversity. I do not need to explain more about this. I do not need to cite examples as to how this Government is trying to protect the pluralistic nature of this country.

Sir, the second point mentioned in this sentence is to protect and deepen the values of secularism. Sir, India is a country which is home to all religions. All religions of the world are here.

(Contd. By PB/2a)

-PK/PB-PSV/2a/4.15

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (CONTD.): Vast majority of the population belongs to the Hindu religion, a vast majority. Then, we have all other religions. Jainism was originated in India; Buddhism was originated in India; Islam is there for more than thousand years. Some people think that Islam came with the advent of Mughals. No; it is wrong. In Kerala, in the Malabar Coast, Islam is there for more than thousand years. Christianity has been there for more than two thousand years, since 52 AD. Some people think that Christianity came with the advent of the British or the Europeans. No. In fact, Christianity came to India before it went to Europe. When Europe was groping in darkness, Christians flourished in the Malabar Coast. So which religion is not Indian?

Then I will tell you one thing. The other day, I saw a photograph in one of the newspapers. That is the incident of Cochin. The photograph was depicting 'The Policeman protecting a Synagogue', which is there in Kerala, Cochin. There is a Synagogue which is more than 700 years old. Synagogue means a 'Jewish Church'. There were only a handful of Jews there. Those Jews were protected by the Government, by the people in Kerala; and, even today, there are a few Jews there. You can go and see it; and because of the fear of terrorist threat, the Government of Kerala has given protection to the Synagogue, and I see the Police protecting the Synagogue. This is our culture. All this belong to India. That is our composite culture. In a way, I would say in a larger sense, all these are Hindus because Hinduism is not just a religion only, it is a culture also. ...(Interruptions)... Why some are clapping and some are creating noise? What is this? ...(Interruptions)...

श्री कप्तान सिंह सोलंकी: आज इनका यह सबसे बड़ा सत्य है ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री उपसभापति: बैठिए, बैठिए ...(व्यवधान)... प्लीज़ ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI RAVI SHANKAR PRASAD: I salute you for what you are saying. ...(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please. Mr. Ravi Shankar Prasad, please. ...(Interruptions)... No; no; please. ...(Interruptions)...

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Please, let me say. I will repeat what I said. What I said is, all these religions belong to India. All those are equally Indians. I said one more sentence. In a wider sense, you can say like that. That is what I said. In a wider sense means, we have a composite culture. What is that? ...(Interruptions)... Okay; fine. You may disagree. I don't mind. Please. But let me speak. Let me have my say. You need not agree with all. Rajnitiji, you need not agree with all what I say.

Then, what is the duty of the Government? Sir, the duty of the Government is to preserve and protect all these sections, to protect their values, their culture. That is the duty of the Government. It is not to try to bring uniformity among all this. That is not possible. That is not possible also; and it is also the duty of the Government to maintain communal harmony. Sir, secularism is not a static

philosophy. It is a dynamic philosophy. Government has to initiate steps to maintain communal harmony. I will say the best example of communal harmony is happening in India. We have a famous temple there, the Sabarimala Temple, a Hindu Temple. Crores of devotees go there for performing Pooja; but before going to Sabarimala, most of them go through a place called Erumeli and worship in mosque.

(Contd. by 2b/SKC)

2b/4.20/skc

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (Contd.): The same people, the same Hindus, worshipping in temples, worship in the mosque too. This happens in Sabarimala, in Kerala, in this very country. This is an example of communal harmony and it is the duty of the Government to preserve and protect this communal harmony. I shall cite another example. (Interruptions) I may, please, be allowed to complete. I may not be saying things which everybody would agree upon, but please allow me to complete.

Sir, I shall cite another example of how a minority community was protected by the Hindu *rajas* in Kerala. Near my village, there is a 700 years old church. The place is called Kallooppa. That church lies adjacent to the temple. The temple and church lie side by side, separated by a wall. I shall tell you how the church came into existence there. Those days, a family was carrying a dead body down the river to a distant place for burial. The local ruler, obviously, a Hindu ruler, was sitting on the bank of the river, enjoying the breeze. He saw these people carrying the dead body for burial. He called them and asked them where they were taking the dead body. They said that they did not have any place for burial there and so, were taking the body to a place 15 kilometres away for burial. The king told them that he would give them place for building a church and thereafter burial. The king gave them a place just by the side of the temple. And even today, 700 years later, that church still remains there. Even the Archaeological Department had gone there and carried out a survey of the church. That is how a minority community was protected by the then rulers.

Sir, minority or majority, it is the responsibility of the Government to protect every community and to protect the secular credentials of this country. That is what this Government is committed to do. I hope, all of you would agree with me that this Government...(Interruptions)... I would like to say one more thing. During the NDA regime, rightly or wrongly, there was an apprehension among a section of people that secularism is at stake. That feeling of apprehension would strike at the roots of emotional integration, which is necessary for national integration. If you break the feeling of emotional integration, then the feeling of national integration would also be broken. That would affect the national unity of the country. Therefore, we need to protect secularism. I have no doubt that this Government could restore the confidence among all sections of the people in protecting the secular credentials.

Sir, another issue that has been talked about here is about rapid growth. When I talk about rapid growth, I wish to say something about the economic policy of the Government also. I compliment this Government for managing the economy well, which I know, most of you would agree with. Of course, when we initiated the economic policy, there were doubts raised by many, especially our friends from the Left. They had real doubts about the economic policies initiated by the Government. Sir, I would confess that even I had a little doubt...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, price-rise has cleared all his doubts. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please...(Interruptions) You may address the Chair.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Yes, Sir. But, Shrimati Brinda Karat is a senior Member and my dear sister; how can I not address her?

(Followed ksk/2c)

KSK/4.25/2c

SHRI D. RAJA: Do you have doubts?

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Now, Sir, I confess that I also had little doubt. Naturally, even the Left parties had their doubts. But, Sir, there is an answer to my doubt. For that, I will request you to recollect a talisman given by Mahatma Gandhiji. Gandhiji said, "Whenever you have a doubt, I give you a talisman. Think about the poorest man

and examine whether your decision is of any use to him. If it is of any use to him, go ahead." That is the talisman of Mahatma Gandhiji. I am going to apply this yardstick.

Sir, I would like Members to recollect the days of 1989 during the regime of late Shri Chandrashekar. I have great respect for him. He was a great son of India. But, during his regime, what happened? Our economy plunged to the lowest ever. We had no money even to run day-to-day affairs of the Government, not to speak of welfare measures. So, we had to take our gold to London, pledge there and bring foreign exchange even for importing essential oil, crude oil, energy. The Government would have been at a standstill at that time.

SHRI D. RAJA: That Government was supported by the Congress Party.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Yes, I agree. I am not blaming anybody. I am not blaming Chandrashekarji also. I am drawing your attention to a situation. Then, election came. After the election, the Congress Government headed by Shri P.V. Narasimha Rao came to power. The Finance Minister in that Government was Dr. Manmohan Singh, who is now our Prime Minister. There was criticism. But, he initiated the new economic policy, which brought about a turn-around. Because of that policy, within one year, the gold, which was pledged in London, was retrieved. The economy came in the correct trajectory; economic growth came in correct trajectory. Sir, similar situation happened in Soviet Union also. They did not react properly. What happened? Soviet Union collapsed. Similar situation was faced in China also. They promptly reacted much before us and they are getting the benefit today. Therefore, without that decision of the then Finance Minister, who is the Prime Minister now, what would have been our position? I am not blaming anybody. And, what no other Government was able to do before, today, the UPA Government has done that. We were able to find Rs.75,000 crores for waiver of loans. Has any other Government been able to do that - just giving away Rs.75,000 crores? It has never happened in the past. Sir, so much money has been given under NREGA. This year, I think, it is Rs.40,100 crores.

GSP-NB-4.30/2D

PROF. P. J. KURIEN (CONTD.): Then, substantial increase in the allocation for all the rural development programmes; substantial increase in allocation for all welfare measures. Where has this money come from? Where has this surplus come from? This surplus was generated because of the proper economic policies followed by the Government, which was initiated by the then Finance Minister, who is the present Prime Minister of this country. As far as I know, there is, more or less, a consensus about this policy. After that, the NDA Government came. The NDA Government also followed the same policy. They did not deviate from that. I appreciate that. I congratulate them. When they found that it is in the interest of the nation, they stuck to that. They did not see politics in that. I congratulate them. This is what everybody should do. This is what I am saying. That is the advantage of that policy. That is why we are able to be in the correct growth trajectory; that is why today we are able to be proud before other nations.

Sir, I mentioned about faster growth. There is no doubt about it. This year, this growth is 7.2 per cent, and, this year is not an ordinary year. This is a year when there is global recession, when there is recession in the entire world, and, when all the developed countries are facing negative growth, be it Europe, be it Japan, or, be it USA. They have experienced negative growth, and, we are able to have 7.2 per cent growth. I don't see it as a wonder. I would say that it is because of the efficient economic management of this Government, the UPA-I and the UPA-II. Sir, in the entire world, only China is ahead of us. Our friend, Mr. Raja would be happy. China is ahead of us because they have ten per cent growth. ..(Interruptions)..

SHRI D. RAJA: I would be happy if India is ahead of China. (Interruptions)

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: I appreciate that. Then, China is ahead of us but, according to me, there is nothing to boast about because China has a rigid administration with no dissent, no opposition, no obstruction, and, no impediments. And, what is our

position? We have the luxury of democracy. ..(Interruptions).. Forget that. We have the luxury of democracy, dissent, opposition, obstruction, and, all impediments. Despite that, we have 7.2 per cent growth. Congratulations to the Prime Minister and the Government. I would say that this is not a small wonder.

Sir, the hon. President has promised a faster growth. I don't want to score the point. But, however, I would like to make a comparison. In the UPA-I regime, what was the average growth? It was 8 per cent if the statistics given is correct. In the NDA regime, the average growth was 5 per cent. This is according to the statistics which I have got. So, there is certainly a momentum in the growth; there is certainly faster growth. And, again, there is an expectation of 9 per cent growth for the next year, and, for the year 2011-12, it is 10 per cent, and, the Government is expecting to see to go to double-digit figure. ..(Interruptions)..

(Contd. by yrsr-2e)

-GSP/YSR-VNK/4.35/2E

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (CONTD.): I am talking about growth, not inflation. (Interruptions) I am talking about growth. Therefore, *Rashtrapatiji* is justified in saying in the President's Address that there is greater growth and faster growth.

Now the fourth cardinal point in that very sentence is the growth with justice and fairness for all. That means inclusive growth, inclusiveness. Sir, inclusiveness is in our very culture, in our very philosophy. It is in the Indian ethos -- *Vasudhaiva kutumbkam*. What does that mean? It means the whole world is one family. What about Indians? We are close family members. In a family it is the responsibility of the elders to care and protect for the weaker ones. Therefore, it is the responsibility of the State to care especially for the weaker sections, the downtrodden, the deprived. (Interruptions) Please. I will answer. It is our responsibility. Sir, we have, for historic reasons, the Scheduled Castes, the Scheduled Tribes, downtrodden, depressed, suppressed, oppressed, denied, and devoid. So, it is the responsibility of the Government to have special programmes targeted for them. Where is the strength of the nation, not only for them but for all weaker sections of

society, whether it is the children or whether it is the women or whether it is people living in villages? The weak should be cared and protected. That is the principle of inclusive growth. Where is the strength of the nation? It is not the strength of the rich, but the poor. You can tie an elephant with a strong chain. But if one link of the chain is weak, the chain is weak. Likewise, if one section of the Indian society, whether it is the SC or the ST or whoever it is, is weak, then India is weak. That is the concept of social inclusiveness. Therefore, the Government should have special targeted programme for protecting and caring the weaker sections of society. That is what this Government is doing.

Sir, during the regime of the NDA -- I am not trying to criticise them, but I am trying to make a point -- there was a slogan called "India shining." That was justifiable in some areas. They were doing well, and some people can say 'India shines.' But what happened when that slogan "India shining" was coined? There was a large section of the people who were suffering. There was another India which suffered, and for those people, that slogan of 'India Shining' was not palatable. They could not digest it. What I am saying is even for a slogan, the message of inclusiveness should be there. That slogan of 'India Shining' actually smacked of lack of inclusiveness. Whether slogan or action or programme, all this should be inclusive. In any programme, there should be an inclusive element, and this Government, I have no doubt, is at it and doing that.

Having said so much, I would like to say this. I have gone through the Budget to see whether I am justified in saying that this Government has a focus on inclusiveness.

(Contd. By VKK/2F)

-YSR/VKK/2f/4.40

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (CONTD.): I would quote from the Budget. For the National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme for the poor and the downtrodden, Rs.40,100 crore has been earmarked; for Bharat Nirman, for infrastructure in the villages, Rs.48,000 crores has been earmarked; for Indira Awas Yojana, unit cost has been increased from Rs.45,000 to Rs.48,000; allocations to backward region grant fund have been raised by 26 per cent, from Rs.5800 crores to Rs.7300 crores; allocation for housing and urban poverty alleviation has been raised to Rs.1000 crores; Plan outlay for women and child development has been increased by 50 per cent. Brindaji will be very happy. Brindaji is not even listening. She will be very happy. (Interruptions) Plan outlay is increased by 50 per cent for women and child development; Plan outlay for the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment has been raised by 80 per cent. You should be very happy. (Interruptions) No, no. Not now. Sorry, I don't want to provoke you. You are my sister. (Interruptions) Sir, for minority affairs, it has been increased by 50 per cent. Sir, all these are programmes focussed at inclusive development.

Then, Sir, I come to another point. The inclusive development is not to be achieved just by implementing certain programmes as such. More than that, there is something called 'empowerment'. See, programmes for the poor have always been there, even during the times of Rajas. Not Mr. Raja, but, Maharajas. There were programmes for the poor. (Interruptions) Sir, there is a difference in perception and philosophy of inclusive growth of this Government. It is not just implementation of programmes. I will narrate or cite some of the important programmes. For example, NREGA -- one hundred days' job for people, minimum wages for 100 days. Earlier also, there were programmes where wages were given to poor people. But, NREGA is not that. It is not just giving employment. It is empowering those people. Before NREGA, they used to go and beg for job. They had to go and request. After NREGA, they will go and demand job, saying, "Give me my job." (Interruptions) Thank you. Now, it is Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee

Scheme. So, today, they can go and demand. It is empowerment. They are empowered. Then, Sir, Right to Education Act. Already, the hon. Minister, Mr. Kapil Sibal, has said that more number of schools would be started; more money would be given to Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan; more money would be given to Mid-Day Meal Scheme, etc. But, it is not just that. Under right to education, a child can go and say, "I want to study. It is my right." Children are empowered. It is empowerment. Sir, then, Food Security Act. Earlier also, food was given at cheap price. (Interruptions) I am talking about the Food Security Act. I admit there is price rise. I admit that. That is an aberration. That would be corrected in course of time. Don't worry about that. The Government will take care of that. Now, we have the Food Security Act. Sir, here, it is not that two kilograms or certain quantity of rice is given. But, it has become a right, a legal right. My friends in Kerala said, "Why the quantity of rice is reduced? We are giving 30 kilograms. Why is it only 20 kilograms?" It is not the quantity.

(Contd. by MKS/2g)

MKS-SC/4.45/2G

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (CONTD.): Here, it has become the right of the person to ask for so much rice. That is empowering him. Sir, the Women's Reservation Bill the Government has promised.....(Interruptions)... Please don't interrupt. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, please yield for a moment.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: No, no, no. I do not yield. ...(Interruptions)... I am not yielding. Sir, the Women's Reservation Bill is, again, introduced for empowering women. The Government has promised to pass the Women's Reservation Bill. I read it in the newspapers that the Cabinet has already approved it. It is already introduced. I had the opportunity of being in the Chair. Thank you, Sir, for allowing me to be in the Chair at that time. I had the opportunity of being in the Chair when the Bill was introduced. Sir, I know there were objections in some sections of the

House, but I request all the Members of this House to pass this Bill. After all, they are our sisters; why not give them their due? ...(Interruptions)... 33 per cent is not more. ...(Interruptions)... 33 per cent is not more. Let us pass this Bill unanimously. I congratulate this Government on taking the bold initiative of bringing that Bill. It is already decided.....(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Please yield for a minute. Since the hon. Prime Minister is here.....(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: On what? ...(Interruptions)...

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Sir, I won't. ...(Interruptions)... Sir, here, I would like to mention.....(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Kindly yield, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the point? ...(Interruptions)... What is the point?

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Sir, on Women's Reservation Bill. The hon. Prime Minister is here.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: I do not yield, Sir. ...(Interruptions)...

SHRIMATI BRINDA KARAT: Our request, Sir, is, 100 Years of Women's Day is going to come up on March 8, the International Women's Day. If, on that day, they bring the Women Reservation Bill for discussion and passage, it will, really, be very good for all of us. That is all I wanted to say.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, we will request the hon. Prime Minister that when he is going to reply to the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address, he should make this announcement, and that will be a rare privilege not only for us but for everybody else also. Sir, we all support it.

SHRIMATI MAYA SINGH: I also support it, Sir.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Madam, the Government has already decided that.....(Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kurien, please continue.

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Sir, I would like to make one point for the information of hon. Members that this Bill was brought in the Lok Sabha several years back; the Women's Reservation Bill, but it was not allowed to be introduced. But Congress Party has taken, and Congress President has taken, a consistent stand in favour of this Bill. Sir, why I am saying this is, when the Bill was brought in the Lok Sabha, Congress Party was in the Opposition. I was Chief Whip at that time. Hence, the Congress President called me and asked me to issue whips to all the MPs for supporting the Bill if that was introduced. I, under the direction of the Congress President, issued whips, at that time, to all Congress MPs of the Lok Sabha, for supporting the Bill if that was passed. Unfortunately, that Bill could not be introduced in that House. I said this to clarify the position of Congress Party.

But, then, Sir, I would like to ask about this women's reservation: where does the origin come from? The origin comes from the Panchayati Raj Bill; 33 per cent reservation for women was allowed in Panchayats. Sir, 33.13 per cent reservation was allowed in panchayats, and it was my beloved leader Rajivji who had initiated, who had mooted this proposal, the Panchayati Raj Bill and the 33 per cent Reservation Bill. That is the basis of this 33 per cent reservation today, and I am happy that the Government has decided to increase that reservation in the local self-Government, in panchayats, to 50 per cent.

Sir, having said that, I would also like to mention the two important decisions or, say, the achievements of the UPA Government. Number one is RTI (Right to Information Act). Sir, Right to Information Act is, actually, empowering the whole people. I think, I should say, that is the most important legislation of that five years' period. I would say that, or, perhaps, that is the most important legislation over a period of time. Why? It is because corruption is a cancer in our society.

(Contd. by TMV/2H)

-MKS-TMV-MCM/2h/4.50

PROF. P. J. KURIEN (CONTD.): It is eating into the vitals of our economy, of our society. What is the remedy? This is one step in the fight against corruption. Now,

bureaucrats have to be more transparent. The Ministers and politicians have to be more transparent. I don't say that this is the panacea. But I would say that this would go a long way in removing the cancer of corruption. So, RTI is one of the greatest achievements.

Another is signing of the civil nuclear deal. The reason why I consider it very important is this. I know today there is, more or less, a consensus. Even the main opposition party says that there is only a slight difference. It wants to amend it slightly. But in principle it is also in support of civil nuclear deal. What was the need? At that time many people asked: What is the need of the nuclear deal? I think it was due to lack of understanding of the problem. It is for energy security. It is Lenin who said that electricity was the key to development. Lenin said, "Electricity is the key to all developments". (Interruptions)...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You please go ahead.

PROF. P. J. KURIEN: There is shortage of electricity. We have shortage of power. People ask: Why don't you exploit or use more coal? But if you use fossil fuel or coal excessively, it will also get depleted. If you over-exploit it, it will be depleted. Prudence demands that we should not over-exploit it. Further, it will add to pollution. Today, when we are fighting against climate change, the excessive use of fossil fuel will affect climate also. Therefore, we can't resort to it. Cleaner energy is a must. What was the way out? The first option was to have a civil nuclear deal, to have an agreement on this. Our Prime Minister took the bold initiative. Despite the criticisms -- there were criticisms -- in the interest of the country, he stood firm and ignored the criticisms. In the interest of the country, he signed the civil nuclear deal and today we have the advantage. I want to quote from the President's Address itself and I quote from paragraph 72 on page 16:

"Following the availability of imported fuel as a result of the opening of international civil nuclear cooperation, commercial production has commenced in two units of Rajasthan Atomic Power Project, -- it is already commenced -- and one more unit is expected to begin commercial production

soon. New agreements for cooperation in the field of civil nuclear energy were concluded with Russia, -- not only with America but also with Russia -- Mongolia, Namibia, Argentina and the United Kingdom, while others are under negotiation".

So, today, we see the results. Sir, we are resorting to not only nuclear option for energy but also to other options for fighting against climate change. As regards solar energy, there is the Jawaharlal Nehru Solar Mission. We have started a gigantic project, scheme, for producing 20,000 megawatts by 2020. This is the commitment of the Government to energy security and cleaner energy.

Sir, I know why you are looking at me. I will not take much time. I have one hour. So, I will try to finish within ten minutes.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You know the allocation of time.

PROF. P. J. KURIEN: Coming to the foreign affairs, there is an allegation that India has deviated from our age-old Non-alignment Policy. We have not at all deviated. We are basing it on non-alignment only and our national interests would be protected. We should strive for world peace.

(Contd. by 2J/VK)

VK/2J/4.55

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (CONTD): We should also strive for more equitable and just world order. That is exactly what the Government is doing. We should have very friendly relations with our neighbours, be it Pakistan or be it China. Well, I am aware that Pakistan is a cradle of terrorism, the epic-centre of terrorism directed against India. But if you cut off the dialogue, what do you do? It is in our interest to engage them in a dialogue. I understand that on 25th February, there was a meeting of Secretaries of both the countries, that is, India and Pakistan about a dialogue. The hon. Minister of External Affairs has made a statement in this House, which, I hope, will be discussed. So, I do not want to touch upon that. But what I am saying is, dialogue is the only way. What is an alternative to the dialogue? I do not want to say that. So we have to engage them in a dialogue, be it Pakistan or be

it China. Dialogue is in our interest. That is what this Government is doing. But, at the same time, we should be well prepared, our defence forces should be well prepared to meet any eventuality. That is what the Government is doing. The other day, when I switched on the television, I saw a very interesting 'Air Show', where our aircraft were targeting missiles and all that. That shows our capability. We are well prepared. Our defence forces are well prepared and should be more prepared. Our Budget for defence has increased. We are not compromising on our defence. Furthermore, I am very happy to say that there is a greater focus on self-reliance. Agni-III missile has been added to our weaponry. Arjun tank has been added to our weaponry. Then our HAL, Bangalore has developed Light Combat Aircraft. All these are milestones in our path towards self-reliance. We have a very, very efficient Defence Minister sitting here whose honesty and integrity nobody can question. I am sure, in his hands, the defence of the country is safe. I have no doubt about it.

Let me come to Information Technology, science and technology, and space science. We should be proud of it. So far as IT is concerned, we are at the top, due to the liberal policies adopted by this Government. The Minister of Science and Technology is here. Yesterday, I saw a report on Chandrayaan. It was carried in all the newspapers: Chandrayaan has discovered ice glaciers on the moon. NASA has already released the photographs. It was done by Chandrayaan. Sir, as a student of Physics, I was the happiest person on that day when Chandrayaan landed on the moon. It gives us great pride. I am so proud of that day. Well, I have no doubt, the day is not far away when we will send a man to the moon. I am looking forward to that. This Government is the one which gives us pride. Every Indian can be proud of this Government. Sir, I will not take more time. I will quote from the last paragraph of the President's Address. (Contd. by 2K)

RG/ASC/5.00/2K

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (contd.): I quote: "The service of India means the service to the millions who suffer. It means ending poverty, ignorance, disease and inequality of opportunity." Without any fear or contradiction, I can say that this Government

has left no stone unturned for achieving those goals. Any number of examples can be cited to prove this. The Government is striving hard to achieve the goals mentioned in this last part of her speech. Maybe, we have not achieved it totally. But, as it has been said in the speech, we are nearer to the goals. We are nearer to the goals set by the founding fathers of our Constitution and our leaders who gave us freedom.

Before concluding, I have to say one more point which I consider to be very important, and that is, with regard to the functioning of the Government, the administration and the leadership of the UPA Government. It is an exemplary dual leadership. We have an erudite Prime Minister whose integrity and honesty cannot be questioned. Nobody can point a finger against him. So, an experienced, erudite person is the head of the Government. Then, we have the UPA Chairperson, with the feather of unparalleled sacrifice on her cap, heading the political dispensation deciding on policies and taking political decisions. Sir, this is an exemplary dual leadership, and this is functioning very well. That is the reason why the UPA Government, did very well. That is the reason why we could come back with a greater majority. That is the reason why the President, in the President's Address, could unfold a large number of programmes. That is the reason why our Prime Minister is here today with confidence. This is the dual leadership we have. Sir, this is an example for others to emulate. The country is fortunate to have these two leaders. I have no doubt that the country is safe in their hands.

I do not want to take more time, as I said, I will finish in one hour. Having said all these points, for all the reasons which I have cited and for many other reasons which I could not cite, for lack of time, which my friends here will cite, and for all the reasons which you are all convinced and which all of you know, the President deserves a unanimous Resolution of gratitude from this House. I request the hon. House to support and pass this Motion unanimously.

Sir, I thank you and I thank everyone for this kind hearing.

(Ends)

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, Shri Santosh Bagrodia to second the Motion.

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (राजस्थान) : डिप्टी चेयरमैन सर, महामहिम राष्ट्रपति महोदया द्वारा संसद के दोनों सदनों के समक्ष दिए गए अभिभाषण में सरकार के कार्यक्रमों, वास्तविकताओं और विजन का ब्योरा दिया गया है, मैं इसके लिए प्रो.पी.जे.कुरियन द्वारा व्यक्त किए जाने वाले धन्यवाद प्रस्ताव का, हृदय से, बड़े मन से, बड़े आदर से समर्थन करता हूँ। वैसे प्रो० कुरियन साहब ने कोई भी ऐसा इश्यु नहीं छोड़ा है, जो बाकी हो। उन्होंने सभी बातें बताई हैं, इसके अलावा बताने के लिए और बातें नहीं रही हैं। फिर भी, सबसे पहले मैं विपक्ष के अपने साथियों को याद दिलाना चाहता हूँ कि महामहिम राष्ट्रपति महोदया ने कहा है, मैं उसको कोट कर रहा हूँ, "आपको बहुत अधिक विधायी कार्य करने हैं, इनके लिए आपका पूर्ण ध्यान अपेक्षित है। "

(2L/LP पर क्रमशः)

21/5.05/lp-ks

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत) : यह कहकर अपनी चिंता व्यक्त की। ..(व्यवधान) ..

डा. (श्रीमती) नजमा ए.हेपतुल्ला : उपसभापति जी, हाउस का सेंस ले लीजिए कि इनकी स्पीच तक हम लोग बैठ सकें।

श्री उपसभापति : यह डिसाइड हुआ था ..(व्यवधान) ..

डा. (श्रीमती) नजमा ए.हेपतुल्ला : मैं आपको डिस्टर्ब नहीं कर रही हूँ, मैं सिर्फ एक प्रोपाइटी की बात कर रही हूँ। If the House so decides, it is fine. No problem.

श्री उपसभापति : यह डिसाइड हुआ था कि the Mover and the Seconder will complete today. That is the decision. (Interruptions)

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, there are hundreds of amendments.

श्री उपसभापति : अमेंडमेंट्स तो मूव करने ही हैं। बी.ए.सी. में डिसाइड हुआ है कि we should sit beyond six.

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: BAC has taken this decision. Okay, Sir. I only wanted to bring it to your notice.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It was decided that after the Seconder has spoken, we will move the amendments.

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया : महोदय, पिछले कुछ सत्रों से संसद के कार्यकरण की जनता द्वारा कड़ी समीक्षा की जा रही है। महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दों पर सूचनापरक और सकारात्मक सुझाव

अपेक्षित होते हैं। संसद वह स्थान है, जहां विभिन्न विचारधाराओं को एकाकार होकर शासन के लिए दिशा-निर्देश देने चाहिए। विपक्ष को अलग दृष्टिकोण रखने का पूरा-पूरा हक है, किंतु उसे अपना दृष्टिकोण इस सदन के सामने रखना होगा। जो भाषण हमारी प्रेसिडेंट साहिबा ने दिया है, मैं बहुत संक्षिप्त में उसके बारे में कहना चाहता हूं। उन्होंने पूरे भाषण में आम आदमी की चर्चा की है, इन्क्लुजिवनेस की चर्चा की है, जो कि हमारी सरकार का मेन इश्यू है। उन्होंने रूरल डेवलपमेंट के बारे में चर्चा की है। 3,74,000 करोड़ रुपए या इसी हिसाब से इस बजट में रूरल डेवलपमेंट के लिए एलोकेशन हुआ है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो. पी.जे.कुरियन)पीठासीन हुए

आज सुबह प्राइसेज के बारे में चर्चा हो रही थी, जिसका जवाब भी आया और एक दिन चर्चा भी हुई कि चीजों के दाम बढ़ रहे हैं, उसको रोकने का एक ही तरीका है, वह है रूरल डेवलपमेंट। यह हमारी प्रेसिडेंट साहिबा ने कहा है। उनका यह भी कहना था कि रूरल डेवलपमेंट के द्वारा ही यह संभव है। उन्होंने यह भी कहा कि "My government is committed to bringing about a paradigm shift in our education infrastructure based on the three pillars of expansion, inclusion and excellence". बिना एजुकेशन के डेवलपमेंट नहीं हो सकता है। इसके बारे में मैं बाद में जाकर कुछ और चर्चा करूंगा। उन्होंने एक और बहुत बड़ी बात कही, जिसके बारे में विपक्ष के लोग हर समय चर्चा करते रहते हैं, वह यह है कि लोगों का रुपया स्विस् बैंक में पड़ा हुआ है, बाहर पड़ा हुआ है। इसकी चर्चा हर समय रही है। यह इस सरकार की हिम्मत है। सर, जब आप यहां बोल रहे थे तब आपने बताया कि यहां राइट टू इन्फॉर्मेशन ऐक्ट की चर्चा हुई, वूमेन्स रिजर्वेशन बिल की चर्चा हुई, वैसे ही प्रेसिडेंट साहिबा ने कहा कि, "My government has undertaken a number of steps to unearth unaccounted money parked outside India. These include amendment of the Income-tax Act, 1961 to enable the Central Government to enter into tax agreements with non-sovereign jurisdictions". यह हिम्मत की बात है कि अगर किसी गलत तरीके से हिंदुस्तान के बाहर पैसा गया हुआ है और वहां पर जमा है, तो हमारी सरकार उसको चाहती है। इसके एग्रीमेंट किए जा रहे हैं और इसके जो भी रास्ते अपनाए जा सकते हैं, वे अपनाएंगे। गलत तरीके से भेजे गए रुपए या धन हिंदुस्तान में वापस आ सके, हमारे गरीब आदमियों के काम आ सके, यह ब्रीफली बात उन्होंने अपने भाषण में की थी। यह

आम आदमी की बात थी। वाइस चेयरमैन सर, प्रथम विश्व युद्ध के बाद महामंदी आई थी। पिछले वर्ष विश्व को भीषण मंदी झेलनी पड़ी। विश्व के अधिकांश कट्टरपंथी अर्थव्यवस्थाओं में भी सरकार के हस्तक्षेप और विनियमन के उपाय पुनः अपनाने पड़े।

(AKG/2M पर जारी)

AKG/2M/5.10

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत) : जब विश्व की आर्थिक महाशक्तियाँ अस्थिर हो गईं, हमारी अर्थव्यवस्था ने उल्लेखनीय प्रगति की और इससे हमारी विश्वसनीयता बढ़ी है। पिछले वर्ष सारे विश्व में जिसे हम developed world कहते हैं, चाहे यूरोप हो या अमेरिका हो, वहाँ पर minus growth हो रही है। अमेरिका में 20 प्रतिशत लोगों के पास आज खाने के लिए व्यवस्था नहीं है, वे सरकार के stand के भरोसे हैं, जिससे उनको दो टाइम का खाना मिल रहा है, जबकि हमारे प्राइम मिनिस्टर डा. मनमोहन सिंह जी के नेतृत्व में सारे संसार में इतनी अव्यवस्था होते हुए भी हिन्दुस्तान की growth होती रही। पिछले वर्ष यह 6.7 प्रतिशत हुई, इस वर्ष हमें इसके 7.5 प्रतिशत होने की पूरी आशा है। हमारी आर्थिक प्रगति का मंत्र यह है कि हमने आम आदमी के लिए निवेश किया है, हमने आम आदमी के बारे में चर्चा की है, हमारी सरकार ने आम आदमी के बारे में विचार किया है। हमारी सरकार का हर step आम आदमी को कैसे लाभ मिले, उसको ध्यान में रख कर उठाया गया है। सरकार ने वित्तीय घाटा उठाया, किन्तु आम आदमी के लिए निवेश किया। आम आदमी हमारे कार्य का केन्द्र है। राष्ट्रपति महोदया ने अपने अभिभाषण के पैरा नम्बर 17 से 23 में आम आदमी की उम्मीदों को पूरा करने में हमारी उपलब्धियों की झलक दिखाई है। इसमें केवल आम आदमी की चर्चा है। उसके साथ उसको मानवीय और समावेशी भी बनाया गया। हमारी सुधार प्रक्रिया व्यावहारिक है। इसलिए इससे हमारे यहाँ अनेक देशों की तरह सामाजिक और राजनीतिक विघटन नहीं हुआ।

2009-10 में मनरेगा में 203 करोड़ श्रम दिवस का सृजन हुआ, जिससे ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों के 4.33 करोड़ परिवारों को लाभ पहुँचा। अगर हम एक परिवार में पाँच व्यक्ति का average लेते हैं, तो 20 करोड़ लोगों को इसका लाभ मिला। जैसा आपने बताया था कि हमारे यहाँ एससी-एसटी हैं, जो सबसे पिछड़े हैं, उनको इसका लाभ मिलना चाहिए, तो यह जो लाभ मिला, उसमें 52 प्रतिशत एससी/एसटी को मिला। यह सरकार की व्यवस्था है। इस बारे में सरकार विचार करती है। इसलिए आम आदमी के व्यापक विकास के लिए भारत निर्माण के

कार्यक्रम को लागू किया गया। भारत का निर्माण करना है, उसमें भी आम आदमी को लाभ होना चाहिए।

2009-10 के दौरान ग्रामीण आवास के अन्तर्गत 14 लाख से अधिक मकानों का निर्माण किया गया। ऐसा काम पहले कभी नहीं हुआ, किसी वर्ष में नहीं हुआ। यह काम यूपीए-1 ने किया और यूपीए-11 उसी काम को और आगे बढ़ा रही है। नवम्बर 2009 तक 34 हजार गाँवों को जोड़ने वाली 96 हजार किलोमीटर लम्बी ग्रामीण सड़कें बनाई गईं। ग्रामीण जल आपूर्ति योजना के अन्तर्गत 586 ग्रामीण बस्तियों को शामिल किया गया। दिसम्बर 2009 तक 70 लाख हेक्टेयर क्षेत्र के लिए सिंचाई सुविधाओं का सृजन किया गया। राजीव गाँधी विद्युतीकरण योजना के अन्तर्गत 67 हजार गाँवों का विद्युतीकरण किया गया। पहले गाँवों में बिजली जाती ही नहीं थी। बिजली का एक प्वायंट दे दिया जाता था और कहा जाता था कि गाँव में बिजली पहुँच गई। अब वह बात नहीं है। उसके नियम बदले गए और यह कहा गया कि गाँवों में जो विद्युतीकरण होगा, वहाँ केवल एक प्वायंट देने से नहीं होगा। यह हिम्मत हमारी यूपीए सरकार की थी और इसके प्रोग्राम को शहरों और गाँवों में आगे बढ़ाया गया।

वर्ष 2014 तक 40 प्रतिशत गाँवों में टेलीफोन की सुविधा देने की बात की गई है। हम स्वप्न में भी नहीं सोचा करते थे कि गाँवों में बैठ कर हम सारी दुनिया से बात कर सकते हैं। (2एन पर जारी)

SCH-KGG/5.15/2N

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत): सर, मुझे 1960 की एक बात याद आ रही है। जोरहाट से 30 किलोमीटर आगे एक टी गार्डन है, वहाँ से मुझे कलकत्ता एक टेलिफोन करना था, उसके लिए पहले मुझे जोरहाट आना पड़ा। उस समय लाइटनिंग कॉल हुआ करती थी, जिसमें रैगुलर कॉल का 16 गुना ज्यादा दाम लगता था। मैंने सुबह आठ बजे आकर लाइटनिंग कॉल बुक कराई और रात दस बजे तक बैठा रहा लेकिन बात नहीं हो पाई। आज परिस्थिति कितनी बदल गई है और कितना अधिक डेवलपमेंट हुआ है। हमारी सरकार के विज़न के कारण आज गाँव-गाँव से सारी दुनिया में बात हो सकती है। यह हमारी सरकार का निश्चय है कि हम पंथ के अंतिम व्यक्ति तक पहुँचेंगे और इसके लिए सरकार ने गरीबों को पुनः परिभाषित करने की पहल की है। दो विशेषज्ञ समितियों ने गरीबी के समूचे मुद्दे पर पुनः आकलन किया है, इस संबंध में मुझे आज एक किताब मिली है,

"Changing Poverty Estimates in India - Some

Recent Developments". सर, यह किताब राज्य सभा की ही है और इसमें सरकार ने तरह-तरह की स्टडीज़ की हैं, जैसे Capability approach, monitoring approach, livelihood approach, social exclusion approach, contextual approach. इसमें तरह-तरह से विचार व्यक्त किया गया कि किस तरह से हम लास्ट आदमी तक पहुंचें। Food Security Act को लेकर इसमें जो लिखा गया है, उसे मैं कोट करना चाहता हूं। इसमें लिखा है, 'The proposed National Food Security Act would seek to ensure food security for all citizens in the country. Its provisions will focus primarily on the weaker sections of the society, that is, below the poverty-line families which otherwise may, at times, face food insecurity. Only the most vulnerable sections of the society will have a legally enforceable right to food that guarantee sufficient food for them.' यह बड़ी हिम्मत की बात है, जो हमारी सरकार ने की है। 'It is proposed by the Centre that every family living below the poverty-line in the rural and urban areas will be entitled by law to 25 kgs. of rice or wheat per month at Rs. 3 per kg.' I further quote. 'The Centre aims to give right to food to 6.52 crores of families.' मतलब करीब 32 या 35 करोड़ जनता। 110 करोड़ की आबादी में करीब 35 करोड़ लोगों को यह सुविधा मिलेगी। 'Constituting the BPL category, according to the Planning Commission estimate, that is, 36 per cent of India's household.' इस सरकार ने आम आदमी के लिए इतना बड़ा प्रोग्राम तय किया है।

सर, लोकतंत्र में आम आदमी के लिए निवेश करना महत्वपूर्ण होता है। हमने इसके लिए स्वर्णिम मध्य-मार्ग अपनाया। हम राजकोषीय आयतुल्ला नहीं हैं कि विकास का गला घोट कर राजकोषीय घाटे पर काबू पाना चाहें, जैसे भाजपा वाले करते हैं। हम अपव्ययी शासक भी नहीं हैं। यहां पर हमारे लैफ्ट के दोस्त भी बैठे हैं, जो राजकोषीय अनुशासन के बिना ठीक से न बनाए गए कार्यक्रमों में संसाधनों को बर्बाद कर रहे हैं। हमारा मानना है कि मौजूदा वैश्विक परिदृश्य में शासन और आर्थिक प्रबंधन को व्यावहारिक होना चाहिए और वे विचारधाराओं से जुड़े नहीं रह सकते।

सरकार ने अर्थव्यवस्था को बनाए रख कर भारी राजकोषीय भार उठाया है। चाहे किसानों के लिए ऋण माफी हो, नरेगा के लिए आबंटन हो, राजकोषीय प्रोत्साहन पैकेज हों अथवा गिरते हुए डॉलर के मद्देनज़र निर्यात क्षेत्र को सहायता हो, सरकार ने अपने राजस्व

की लागत पर उनकी सहायता की है। हमने आम आदमी की जेब में धन डालने के लिए आम आदमी से जुड़ी योजनाएं बनाई हैं, जिससे अर्थव्यवस्था में काफी मांग का सृजन हुआ है। यह जो प्राइसिज़ बढ़ने की बात की जा रही है, इसके पीछे भी एक कारण है। आम आदमी की पॉकेट में जो पैसा गया है, इससे उसकी इच्छाएं बढ़ रही हैं।

20/psv पर जारी

-SCH/PSV-KLS/20/5.20

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया(क्रमागत): मुझे याद है कि आज से 10-15 साल पहले तक हमारे राजस्थान के गाँवों में दाल के अलावा कुछ नहीं मिलता था। सब्जी नहीं मिलती थी। जिस आलू की बात हम कह रहे हैं, उसकी चर्चा मैं बाद में करूँगा। वहाँ आलू भी नहीं मिलता था जबकि आज वहाँ मटर भी मिलती है। हमारी इच्छाएँ और हमारी आवश्यकताएँ बढ़ गई हैं। यह अच्छी बात है। मैं इसके विरोध में नहीं हूँ। लेकिन, जब demand बढ़ती है तो स्वाभाविक रूप से थोड़े दाम भी बढ़ते हैं। सर, यह नयी डील, रूजवेल्ट की नयी डील से बड़ी है। प्रेजिडेंट रूजवेल्ट ने भी जब depression हुआ था तब यह डील दी थी, लेकिन हमारी सरकार ने डा० मनमोहन सिंह जी के नेतृत्व में वहाँ की डील से भी बड़ी डील गाँवों को आगे बढ़ाने के लिए दी है। हम "नरेगा" अथवा "राष्ट्रीय कृषि विकास योजना" अथवा "राजीव गांधी आवास योजना" जैसे कार्यक्रमों के माध्यम से ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में धन पहुँचा रहे हैं। कृषि के मामले में हमें अविलम्ब ठोस कार्रवाई करने की आवश्यकता है। यदि इसकी ओर ध्यान नहीं दिया गया तो अर्थव्यवस्था पर इसके मुद्रास्फीति संबंधी गम्भीर दबाव बने रहेंगे। यह green revolution हमें फिर से लाना ही पड़ेगा।

मैं अभी इसके बारे में कुछ figures आपको दूँगा। हमारी productivity आज भी वही है जो दस वर्ष पहले थी, area वही है जो दस वर्ष पहले था, population बढ़ गई, demand बढ़ गई। इससे दाम तो बढ़ेंगे। ...(व्यवधान)... एरिया कम हुआ है? एरिया कम नहीं हुआ है। मैं आपको बता दूँगा। मैं आपको figures भी दूँगा। ...(व्यवधान)... मैं तो आपको सब figures दूँगा। ...(व्यवधान)... एक मिनट, मैं अभी आपको figures दे रहा हूँ। राष्ट्रपति जी के अभिभाषण में खाद्य पदार्थों की कीमतों पर नियंत्रण करने के मामले में सरकार के संकल्प का उल्लेख भी किया गया है और इसकी चर्चा आज सुबह भी हुई है। इसके थोड़े-बहुत figures मैं आपको अभी तुरंत दूँगा। हम जानते हैं कि पिछले कुछ महीने कठिनाई भरे रहे हैं, किन्तु इन समस्याओं को संकीर्ण और दलगत दृष्टि से देखने के बजाय हमें जरूरत है कि हम विश्व की

अर्थव्यवस्था में आई वृहत् प्रवृत्तियों को ध्यान में रख कर उस संदर्भ में अपने कार्य करें। हमें कीमतों को स्थिर रखने के लिए विश्व के बाजार से ऊँची कीमतों पर खाद्यान्नों का आयात भी करना पड़ा है। जब wheat की shortage हुई तो सरकार ने तय किया कि हम import कर रहे हैं। यहाँ पर MSP rate दस रुपए थी और वहाँ से 16 रुपए में import कर रहे हैं। सारे लोग जो विपक्ष के थे, वे चर्चा करने लगे कि हमारे किसानों को कम दे रहे हैं और वहाँ ज्यादा दे रहे हैं। किसी ने यह विचार नहीं किया कि हमें अपने भूखे लोगों के लिए import करना पड़ रहा है। यह एक temporary measure था। जहाँ एनडीए सरकार ने दस रुपए per year increase किया था, वहीं हमारी सरकार ने आने के बाद 100 रुपए, 70 रुपए increase किया। मैं आपको इसका year-wise figure देने को तैयार हूँ-- साढ़े तीन सौ, चार सौ रुपए दिए और उसके बाद भी इनको संतोष नहीं है। लेकिन, हमारी सरकार ने फिर भी import किया। लोगों को भूखा नहीं मरने दिया। यूपीए सरकार ने सभी खाद्यान्नों के न्यूनतम समर्थन मूल्य में वृद्धि की। इसके साथ ही कृषि उत्पादन तो ज्यों का त्यों रहा, जबकि इसका रकबा घटता जा रहा है। यहाँ Leader of the Opposition ने हाल ही में price rise पर भाषण दिया था। उनके दो-तीन points थे। एक point था, which I quote. यह uncorrected है, but I hope it is right. "The commodities exchanges came up, well, these are all experiments to be done when you are dealing with a surplus economy of foodgrains." वह यह खुद बोल रहे हैं कि "This was an experiment. They did the experiment." सरकार experiment नहीं करती है बल्कि सरकार के अपने vision होते हैं। उन्होंने कहा कि हम experiment कर रहे थे। "If your population is rising, if your foodgrain increase and the production is not adequate along with it and now you have transgressed in the year 2010 into an economy of shortages ----." मैं केवल यही कहना चाहता हूँ कि सरकार experiment नहीं करती, सरकार अपने निर्णय लेती है।

उन्होंने दूसरी बात कही। "Sir, on 15th February, 2010 you allowed export of 10,000 tonnes of sugar to Europe when there is scarcity in the market because you have an international commitment."

(2पी/डी0एस0 पर क्रमशः)

SSS-DS/2P/5.25

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत): ये खुद कह रहे हैं कि international commitment था। वे आगे कह रहे हैं "If you cancelled it yesterday and this obligation could be deferred to

a period till we have surplus, well this should have struck somebody on 15th February, this year itself". International commitment का अपना एक मूल्य होता है। अभी सुबह बताया गया कि हमारी total demand 1 लाख 85 हजार टन है और अगर हम availability की बात करें तो हमारे पास 50 लाख टन का short fall है। 10 हजार टन कोई मायने नहीं रखता है। क्या हम इस तरह के कमिटमेंट को कैंसल कर सकते हैं? .. (व्यवधान).. हमारे भारतवर्ष की सारी दुनिया में एक इज्जत है। यह nation to nation Agreement है। इसको हम इस तरह कैंसल नहीं कर सकते हैं। यह बात समझने की दरकार है। ..(व्यवधान)

डा. (श्रीमती) नजमा ए. हेपतुल्ला: आपने commitment को cancel क्यों किया? ..(व्यवधान)

श्री बलबीर पुंज : तो फिर आपने कैंसल क्यों किया? ...(व्यवधान)

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया: ये जिसे कैंसल करना बोल रहे हैं, वास्तव में उनसे फिर से Agreement किया गया, वह कैंसल नहीं हुआ। इसे समझ कर उनसे mutually agree किया गया। ..(व्यवधान).. ये जो कैंसल की बात बोल रहे हैं, वह कैंसल नहीं होता। ...(व्यवधान).. अच्छा, आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए। फिर उन्होंने कहा, "We repeatedly increased the MSP more than what previous Governments have done. The MSP increases have resulted in this new burden as far as consumers are concerned." अब यह बात उनके लिए और हमारे लिए भी बड़ी complicated है कि एक तरफ वह बोलते हैं कि MSP बढ़ाओ, दूसरी तरफ फिर बोलते हैं कि यह consumer को affect करेगा और अगर MSP न बढ़ाओ तो किसान को affect करेगा। आप चाहते क्या हैं? इनका कोई vision नहीं है, कोई विचार नहीं है। ये लिखते हैं, "But once MSP increases are given and a particular crop cultivation is made attractive, the increase of cultivation of the crop increases and the increased production lead to drop in prices." These are all contradictory statements which have been made and मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि MSP is not simply supply listing. MSP is not done for increasing the supply. MSP is basically a remunerative price to the farmers. इसका यह purpose है कि farmers को अपनी पैदावार का पूरा पैसा मिलना चाहिए। So, the argument that increased MSP will bring down the prices in longer run is not correct. It is not the policy of a welfare Government to lay trap of MSP for farmers. This is not the policy.

Sir, the Finance Minister in his Budget Speech is candid in admitting that food inflation is a cause of worry and needs to be addressed. He admitted and he mentioned about erratic monsoon, he mentioned about drought like condition but what has he provided for? What has this Government provided for? "Twenty-five per cent of the plan outlay earmarked for rural, infrastructure development, Rs. 300 crore to organise 60,000 pulses and oil seed villages and provide integrated intervention of water shed and related programmes, Rs. 200 crores provided for climate resilient agriculture initiative, to continue giving cash subsidy for fuel and fertilizer instead of PDS practice of bonds, deficit in food grain storage capacity to be met by private sector participation, Repayment of loan by farmers extended by six months to June 30th 2010 in view of drought and floods in many parts of the country". These are the provisions जिन्हें इस सरकार ने इस बजट में दिये हैं। ये specific steps उठाये गये हैं, जिससे हमारे farmers को तकलीफ न हो, प्रोडक्शन बढ़े और दाम गिरे।

सर, प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब यहाँ बैठे हैं। मैं अपनी तरफ से two suggestions देना चाहता हूँ कि हिन्दुस्तान की जो holdings हैं, वे बहुत छोटी-छोटी holdings हैं। ये एक एकड़, दो एकड़ या चार एकड़ की हैं। उनकी mechanization नहीं हो सकती है। मैं अभी figures दिखाऊँगा। 10 वर्ष पहले हमारी जो productivity थी, वही productivity आज भी है। जब तक productivity नहीं बढ़ेगी, हमारे हिन्दुस्तान में जो जमीन है, वह तो उतनी ही है, उसको आप कैसे बढ़ाएँगे? एक तरीका है कि सिंचाई की जाए।

(2क्यू/एकेए पर क्रमशः)

-SSS/NBR-AKA/2Q/5.30.

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत) : जमीन के हिसाब से राजस्थान सबसे बड़ा प्रदेश है, लेकिन वहाँ पर कोई पैदावार नहीं हो सकती। अगर नदियों को मिलाया जाए और वहाँ हमारे पास पानी आए तो हम बहुत जमीन पर खेती कर सकते हैं। लेकिन, वह कब होगा ..(व्यवधान).. वह बाद में देखा जाएगा। मेरा सजेशन यह है कि अगर इसको corporatise किया जाए, corporatise कहने का मतलब यह नहीं है कि जो मिलिक्यत है, वह मिलिक्यत तो वैसे की वैसे ही रहेगी, गवर्नमेंट के कंट्रोल के साथ अगर किसी प्राइवेट corporations को उसकी जिम्मेदारी दी जाए, जिससे उसकी productivity बढ़ सके ..(समय की घंटी) Sir, you told

me one hour as the Chief Whip. I have not completed. I have not even started my speech. I have too many things to say. Now, I will do it fast if you want.
 ..(व्यवधान).. NCP का टाइम तो अलग है, यह हमारे टाइम के बारे में बात है। A model contract between the owner-farmer and sharecroppers must be signed with Government's guarantee. अगर इस तरह का कुछ किया जाए तो productivity बढ़ जाएगी। अभी इन्होंने refer किया था कि मंडी में price क्या है और यहां आकर हमारे खाद्यान्न का जैसे आलू, प्याज़, Cauliflower, टमाटर आदि का दाम तीन गुना ज्यादा है। मैंने आज अपनी पत्नी से बात की और पता लगाया कि यह बात कहां तक सत्य है, क्योंकि मुझे भी इतना मालूम नहीं था। देखिए, मंडियां भी बहुत हैं - आजादपुर, ओखला, कोटला, महारौली आदि और यह मैं सिर्फ दिल्ली की बात कर रहा हूं और दिल्ली में भी जब आप खान मार्केट में खरीदते हैं तो दूसरा रेट होता है और जो लोग ठेले पर सामान लेकर बेचते हैं, उन पर आप क्या कंट्रोल कर सकते हैं? इसलिए यह जो पांच-छः जगह से होकर आता है ..(व्यवधान).. वृंदा जी, आप क्या कहना चाह रही हैं?

श्रीमती वृंदा कारत : सर, ये तो रेहड़ी वालों के ऊपर दोष दे रहे हैं। महंगाई बढ़ाने का दोष आप रेहड़ी वालों के ऊपर दे रहे हैं।

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया : मैंने किसी को दोष नहीं दिया, मैंने तो केवल एक तरीका बताया कि किस तरह से सात-आठ जगहों से होकर आता है। तो मंडी में जो दाम होता है, वह दाम आपको यहां नहीं मिल सकता, मैंने तो केवल आपको इतनी बात कही है।

अब मैं जल्दी से केवल productivity की बात कह देता हूं। Area under production for rice 2003-04 में 42,592.5 हजार हैक्टेयर्स था, आज 2008-09 में 45,351.7 हजार हैक्टेयर्स है, फील्ड यील्ड 2078 kg प्रति हैक्टर था, आज 2186 है। ऐसे ही व्हीट 26,594.7 हजार हैक्टेयर्स थी, आज 27,877 हजार हैक्टेयर्स है, यील्ड थी 2713 kg, आज है 2891, इससे कम प्रोडक्शन से काम नहीं चल सकता। जब दाल का सवाल आता है क्योंकि हम vegetarian हैं, हम तो मछली और चिकन नहीं खा सकते, दाल ही खानी पड़ती है। दाल का total production अगर आप देखें तो यह 2003-04 में 14 मिलियन था, आज भी 14 मिलियन है, बल्कि कम हो गया है 14.9 से 14.6 हो गया है। अब 4 मिलियन टन का जब तक कोई रास्ता न बने, तब तक कोई भी रास्ता नहीं है इसके दाम गिरने का। दाम तभी गिर सकता है जब कि सप्लाई ज्यादा हो। यह बेसिक इकनॉमिक पॉलिसी है कि जब तक सप्लाई नहीं बढ़ेगी, डिमांड से ज्यादा सप्लाई नहीं होगी, तब तक दाम कम होने का कोई रास्ता नहीं है।

मैं एक सुझाव देना चाहता हूँ आप सबके सामने। हमारे पास जमीन की कमी है, ठीक है, जैसे कोयले की कमी थी तो मोज़ाम्बिक में जाकर हमने कोल माइन्स लीं, इसी तरह से ऐसे बहुत से देश हैं जहाँ पर जमीन पड़ी हुई है, मैं प्रधान मंत्री जी से अनुरोध करता हूँ कि सरकार के लैवल पर वह जमीन वहाँ पर ले ली जाए, 30,000, 40,000 एकड़ जमीन ली जा सकती है और फिर हमारे पंजाब के या और दूसरे प्रदेशों के जो अच्छे-अच्छे फार्मर्स हैं उनको भेजकर वहाँ खेती की जाए तो शायद वहाँ का सामान यहाँ आएगा तो यहाँ काफी बहुतायत में गेहूँ, चावल, vegetables, fruits etc. हो सकते हैं।

(‘2r/nb’ पर जारी)

NB/2R/5.35

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत) : इसकी व्यवस्था के बारे में भी विचार करना पड़ेगा, वरना तो जितनी जमीन है, उतनी productivity भी न बढ़े, जमीन भी न बढ़े, तो दामों को बढ़ने से रोकना एक मुश्किल काम हो जाएगा।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, इतनी तकलीफें होने के बाद भी Economic Survey की जो फिगर्स आई हैं, उनमें से मैं सदन को दो-चार फिगर्स बताना चाहता हूँ जिससे आप यह जान सकें कि हिंदुस्तान का कितना डेवलपमेंट हुआ है। Export and import of chemicals and petrochemicals का जहाँ तक सवाल है, 2006-07 में 39,351 करोड़ रुपए का export हुआ और 2008-09 में 53,738 करोड़ रुपए का export हुआ, यानी बढ़ा। सारी दुनिया में chemicals का export कम हो रहा है, हिंदुस्तान का बढ़ रहा है। यह सब हमारी सरकार की पॉलिसीज़ के कारण है। जहाँ तक petro chemicals का सवाल है, 2006-07 में 21,801 करोड़ रुपए का export हुआ और 2008-09 में 77,964 करोड़ रुपए का export हुआ। इसी तरह जहाँ तक imports का सवाल है, imports भी बढ़े हैं, इसका यह मतलब नहीं है कि हमें तकलीफ हुई, यह इसलिए ज्यादा हुए, क्योंकि यहाँ डिमांड ज्यादा बढ़ी। 2006-07 में chemicals का 47,914 करोड़ रुपए का import हुआ और 2008-09 में 74,857 करोड़ रुपए का import हुआ। इससे आप समझ सकते हैं कि देश में कितनी जबर्दस्त ग्रोथ हुई है। जहाँ तक petro chemicals के import का सवाल है, 2006-07 में 16,339 करोड़ रुपए का import हुआ और 2008-09 में 24,020 करोड़ रुपए का import हुआ। मैं आपको ये फिगर्स इसलिए बता रहा हूँ, जिससे आपको पता चल सके कि हिंदुस्तान की economy आगे बढ़ रही है और बहुत जोर से आगे

बढ़ रही है। जहां तक production of steel का सवाल है, 2005-06 में यह 46.56 मिलियन टन था, यह 2008-09 में बढ़कर 57.16 मिलियन टन हो गया, यानी इसकी भी ग्रोथ हुई है। इसी तरह से real consumption जहां 2005-06 में 41.43 मिलियन टन था, यह 2008-09 में बढ़कर 52.35 मिलियन टन हो गया, यानी स्टील में production भी बढ़ा और consumption भी बढ़ा। अगर हम machinery & equipment को देखें, जो कि एक बैरोमीटर है, तो 2001-02 में machinery & equipment का index figure 200 था, वह बढ़कर 450 से ऊपर चला गया। इसी तरह से IT की फिगर्स हैं - वहां पर 70 परसेंट, 58 परसेंट, 48 परसेंट की ग्रोथ हुई है। हमारी जो CPSEs हैं, उनका turnover 15.4 परसेंट बढ़ा, उनकी foreign exchange earnings भी 9.6 परसेंट बढ़ीं। मैं ये फिगर्स केवल इसलिए दे रहा हूं कि आपको चिंता करने की आवश्यकता नहीं है, सभी तरह से देश की economic growth हो रही है। इस देश में energy की growth भी हुई है। Power growth 6.3 परसेंट हुई, coal growth 9.3 परसेंट हुई, यानी हर चीज की growth हो रही है, आप चिंता न करें। यहां तक कि अमरीका के प्रेज़ीडेंट ओबामा जी ने अपने भाषण में बड़ी घबराहट के साथ अपने साथियों से कहा कि जिस तरह से हिंदुस्तान में सबसे ज्यादा इंजीनियर्स पैदा हो रहे हैं, डॉक्टर्स पैदा हो रहे हैं, मैनेजर्स पैदा हो रहे हैं, अगर हमारी व्यवस्था में हम उनसे आगे नहीं बढ़ें, तो हिंदुस्तान हमसे बहुत आगे बढ़ जाएगा। यह ओबामा साहब की प्रॉब्लम है और उनको इस बात को लेकर घबराहट हो रही है।

उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, रोटी, कपड़ा और मकान सबकी बुनियादी जरूरत है। मैं इनको salute करता हूं कि इन्होंने उन परिस्थितियों में न्यूक्लियर एनर्जी का agreement किया।

2S/VNK पर क्रमशः

-NB/VNK-PK/2s/5.40

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत) : सरकार चली जाए, लेकिन देश को बचाना है। यह इनकी भावना थी, यह हमारे नेता श्रीमती सोनिया गांधी की भावना थी, हमारे युवा नेता श्री राहुल गांधी की भावना थी और हमारे प्रधान मंत्री की भावना थी कि हमें सरकार नहीं बचानी है, बल्कि हमें देश को बचाना है। खासकर मैं राजस्थान का हूँ और हमें पता है कि हमारे यहां न कोयला है और न पानी है। अभी उन्होंने बताया कि दो रिएक्टर्स already चालू हो गए हैं और पहले भी चालू हुए थे। मेरा माननीय प्रधान मंत्री जी से अनुरोध है कि आप राजस्थान में

जितने Nuclear Power Reactors लगाना चाहते हैं, आप वहां पर लगाएं। हमारे पास बहुत जमीन है, कोई population नहीं है, कोई खतरा नहीं है और कोई population को कोई खतरा नहीं है। वहां मीलों-मील तक लोग नहीं हैं। आप वहां पर रिएक्टर्स लगाएं और वह पावर राजस्थान को भी मिले और सारे हिन्दुस्तान को भी मिले। हमें इसमें कोई असुविधा नहीं होगी।

महोदय, एक सेमिनार में किसी ने कहा कि मुंबई को कमर्शियल हब बना दिया जाए। इसमें हमें कोई आपत्ति नहीं है, लेकिन आप कैसे उसको कमर्शियल हब बना सकते हैं, जहां पर धर्म के नाम पर लड़ाई हो, जाति के नाम पर लड़ाई हो और क्षेत्र के नाम पर लड़ाई हो? हमें शांति चाहिए। कमर्शियल हब तब बन सकता है, जब वहां पर शांति हो। यह शांति जहां नहीं होगी, जहां के लोगों की भावनाओं में शांति नहीं होगी, वहां पर यह हब नहीं बन सकता है ..(व्यवधान)..

DR. (SHRIMATI) NAJMA A. HEPTULLA: Sir, we have to move the amendments before 6 o'clock.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Santoshji, please conclude.

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Sir, I am finishing my speech. Just give me five minutes. ..(Interruptions).. महोदय, मैं जल्दी से एक-दो मिनट में आपको बता देता हूँ। मैं sugar की बात नहीं करूंगा, वह हो चुकी है। मैं केवल small industries की बात बताना चाहता हूँ। That is very dear to me and also very dear to all of us. The UPA-I passed an Act. Many issues were raised in that Act like supply of steel, supply of coal and all this, but a very revolutionary decision was taken. This is now an Act, this is a law. This law says that payment by PSUs and everybody else will have to be made to small industries within 45 days from the day of acceptance. This law was not there before. Earlier, they were paying in 180 days or they were paying in one year. Now, under this law, it has to be paid within 45 days. Sir, the National Rural Health Mission was launched in April 2005 by the hon. Prime Minister, Dr. Manmohan Singh, to provide accountable, accessible and quality health care in the remotest corners of India. Every year, about Rs.50,000 crores are being given by the Government to upgrade physical infrastructure, for provision of equipment and engagement of human resources, personnel at the District Health Centres. During

the last five years, about 90 per cent of the District Health Centres have been upgraded while 70 per cent of Primary Health Centres are under the process of upgradation. Sir, *Janani Suraksha Yojna* has been introduced for the welfare of women and children. मैं केवल कार्यक्रमों की बात बता रहा हूँ, जिन पर इस सरकार ने हजारों करोड़ रुपए लगाए हैं, जहां आवश्यकता थी। जब शिक्षा की बात आई, तो मैं नागालैण्ड की बात करना चाहता हूँ। पता नहीं आप लोगों में से कितने लोगों को नागालैण्ड के बारे में पता है, क्योंकि मैं 1960 से नागालैण्ड जा रहा हूँ। वहां जाने के लिए दीमापुर, इंफाल जाने के लिए मिलिट्री का एक convoy जाता था।

(21/MP पर जारी)

MP-PB/2T/5.45

श्री संतोष बागड़ोदिया (क्रमागत) : हमारी गाड़ी बीच में रहती थी। आगे और पीछे मिलिटरी रहती थी, तब जाकर हम वह रास्ता पार करके मणिपुर पहुंचते थे। यह मैंने खुद किया है और वर्षों तक किया है। आज नागालैण्ड में 100 परसेंट education है। इस education के कारण क्या हुआ? वहां शांति हुई और उस शांति का लाभ क्या हुआ कि आज ordinary बच्चे नागालैण्ड घूमने जा सकते हैं। मेरी बेटी अभी थोड़े दिन पहले नागालैण्ड गई थी। वह किस परिस्थिति में गई, मैं बहुत घबराया हुआ था, लेकिन वह बहुत आराम से गई और आराम से आ गई। यह शिक्षा का लाभ होता है। शिक्षा के क्षेत्र में इस सरकार ने क्या किया? सर्व शिक्षा अभियान चलाया, मिड-डे मील प्रोग्राम चलाया, राष्ट्रीय माध्यमिक शिक्षा अभियान चलाया, Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act पास किया।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Mr. Bagrodia, please conclude.

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: Sir, I am just using the names only. I am not going into the details. 373 model colleges को फायदा मिला। National Mission for Education through Information and Communication Technology चलाया। भारत को साक्षर बनाने का अभियान चलाया। National Council for Higher Education and Research will soon be established. Foreign Education में भी सुविधा कराई। ..(व्यवधान)... सांसद के रूप में हमें जिम्मेदारी के साथ ...

उपसभाध्यक्ष : जल्दी खत्म कीजिए।

SHRI SANTOSH BAGRODIA: I am just finishing. Last two minutes, please. सांसद के रूप में हमें जिम्मेदारी के साथ इस सरकार का मार्गदर्शन और समर्थन करना चाहिए, जो

यू.पी.ए. की अध्यक्ष और प्रधान मंत्री के नेतृत्व में अपनी पूरी ईमानदारी के साथ समाज के प्रत्येक वर्ग को विकास का अवसर प्रदान करने के लिए प्रयासरत है।

इन्हीं शब्दों के साथ मैं महामहिम राष्ट्रपति जी के प्रति धन्यवाद और कृतज्ञता ज्ञापित करने वाले इस प्रस्ताव को स्वीकार करने के लिए इस सभा से अनुरोध करता हूँ।

(समाप्त)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, the Motion that has been moved and seconded is that an Address be presented to the President in the following terms:

"That the Members of the Rajya Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which she has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on February 22, 2010."

Now, there are 643 amendments to the Motion which may be moved at this stage.

(Text of amendments moved to be incorporated)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. P.J. KURIEN): Now, the amendments have been moved. The discussion will continue.

The House is adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11.00 a.m.

The House then adjourned at fifty-one minutes past five of the clock till eleven of the clock on Thursday, the 4th March, 2010.

